riots in their own territory, they suspended their exports, further aggravating scarcity in the markets and amplifying the rise in prices. As Clavreul writes, "Many producer countries... blocked or limited their exports, first of wheat (Ukraine, Argentina, and so on), then rice (Vietnam, India, and so on)."

One day in May 2009 in Senegal, accompanied by Adama Faye, an agronomist and overseas development adviser to the Swiss embassy, and his driver, Ibrahima Sar, I am en route with my wife, Erica, heading north toward Senegal's big plantations. I have brought with me—and have spread out on my knees—the most recent statistical tables from the African Development Bank. The asphalt road is straight, monotonous. Baobab trees line the way; the earth is yellow and dusty despite the morning hour. It is stifling inside the old black Peugeot.

I question Faye uninterruptedly. He is a placid man, full of good humor, extraordinarily good at what he does. But I can sense his rising agitation; my incessant questioning seems to annoy him.

We are crossing the Ferlo. There are hardly any young people left in this semiarid pastoral region. The Ferlo was once home to half a million inhabitants. Tens of thousands of them have migrated to the shantytowns of Dakar. Others have taken the risk of a night-time ocean crossing to the Canary Islands. Some have disappeared with all their belongings, and their bodies have never been found.

There is not enough water. Rail service from Dakar to Saint-Louis, 320 kilometers (200 miles) away in the northwest, ended long ago. The rails rust peacefully in the sun and are covered over by sand. Soil erosion, the government's negligence, and the deep poverty that leaves people stranded in lethargy have prevailed over the life energy of this magnificent country.

We arrive in the cattle market town of Louga. We are still 100 kilometers (62 miles) from Saint-Louis. Suddenly Faye stops the car. "Come! Let's go see my little sister. . . . She doesn't need your statistics to tell you what's going on."

A meager market, just a few stalls by the side of the road. Mounds of *niébé* (cowpeas) and manioc, a few chickens cackling inside their cages. Peanuts, a few wrinkled tomatoes, potatoes. Oranges and clementines from Spain. Not a sole mango, though Senegal is very famous for them. Behind one of the wooden stalls, a cheerful young woman in a bright yellow *kaftan* and matching head scarf sits chatting with her neighbors. Faye introduces us to Aisha, who is in fact his cousin. She is keen to answer my questions, but the more she talks, the more I sense her mounting anger. Her neighbors in the adjacent stalls join in. Soon a joyous, noisy crowd of children of all ages, young people, and old women has gathered around us on the dusty verge of the road to the north. Everyone wants to have their say, to express their indignation.

A price of a 50-kilogram (110-pound) sack of imported rice has gone up to 14,000 West African CFA francs (about \$35). As a result, soup for the evening meal has become more and more watery, with only the few grains a housewife can spare floating in the pot. No one in the nearby area is any longer able to buy more than a quarter sack of rice—to buy a whole sack is out of the question. At the grocer's, the women are now buying rice by the cupful. In the last few years a small bottle of gas has gone up from 1,300 to 1,600 CFA francs, a kilo of carrots from 175 to 245, and a baguette from 140 to 175, while a tray of thirty eggs has risen in one year from 1,600 to 2,500. For fish, same story. The men who, in their small white trucks, bring dried fish from the city of M'bour on the Petite Côte, south of Dakar, are asking 300 francs CFA per kilogram.

Aisha is angry, speaking in a loud voice, sometimes laughing, her laughter bright, joyful, like spring rain. Now she makes a show of scolding her neighbors, who are too timid, in her opinion, in their descriptions of their situation. "Tell the *toubab* [white man] what you pay for a kilo of rice! Tell him! Don't be afraid. The prices for everything are going up almost every day."

"Whose fault is that?" I ask.

Aisha replies, "The truckers—they're thieves...." All goods arrive by road, because the government has shut down the railway.

Faye interrupts to defend the truckers: "At the pump, a liter of gas costs 618 CFA francs; a liter of diesel, 419 francs."

Aisha has pointed out a serious problem often neglected by statisticians, who focus only on the prices of imported food, but not costs added by such factors as transportation. Rice is the staple food in Senegal. The government imports about 75 percent of the rice consumed in the country annually, dealing with the multinational corporations that dominate the market. This rice is sold FOB (free on board) to the Senegalese government. In other words, the price does not include the cost of insurance or transport. Now, in 2008, the price of oil spiked to \$150 a barrel on the spot market in Rotterdam. Aisha and her seven children paid the bill. In Louga, and throughout the Ferlo, the prices of essential goods practically doubled in one year. Of course, oil is also prey for the tiger sharks. This is how high finance slowly devours the economy.

Let us consider next the first months of 2011. The most recent explosion in prices has a bitter taste of déjà vu. The World Bank has written:

The World Bank's food price index rose by 15% between October 2010 and January 2011, is 29% above its level a year earlier, and only 3% below its June 2008 peak. . . . The increase over the last quarter is driven largely by increases in the price of sugar (20%), fats and oils (22%), wheat (20%), and maize (12%).

The World Bank estimates that at least 44 million men, women, and children belonging to vulnerable groups in low- and middle-income countries have, since the beginning of 2011, entered the shadow world of the undernourished, whose lives are scarred by hunger, family disintegration, extreme poverty, and fear of tomorrow. As the World Bank reports:

Higher global wheat prices have fed into sharp increases in domestic wheat prices in many countries. The transmission rate of global wheat price increases to the domestic price of wheat-related products has been high in many countries. For instance, between June 2010 and December 2010, the price of wheat increased by large amounts in Kyrgyzstan (54%), Bangladesh (45%), Tajikistan (37%), Mongolia (33%), Sri Lanka (31%), Azerbaijan (24%), Afghanistan (19%), Sudan (16%), and Pakistan (16%).

# The report continues:

Maize prices have increased sharply and are affected by complex linkages with other markets. In January 2011, maize prices were about 73% higher than [in] June 2010. These increases are due to a series of downward revisions of crop forecasts, low stocks (U.S. stocks-to-use ratio for 2010/11 is projected to be 5%, the lowest since 1995), the positive relationship between maize and wheat prices, and the use of corn for biofuels. Ethanol production demand for corn increases as oil prices go up, with sugar-based ethanol less competitive at current sugar prices.

## Furthermore:

Domestic rice prices have risen sharply in some countries and remained steady in others. The domestic price of rice was significantly higher in Vietnam (46%) and Burundi (41%) between June-December 2010. Indonesia (19%), Bangladesh (19%), and Pakistan (19%) have increased in line with global prices. These Asian countries are large rice consumers, especially among the poor.

Practically all the experts (except, naturally, the speculators themselves) recognize that the evidence shows how speculation plays a determining—and harmful—role in sudden increases in food prices. Two important commentators should be cited here.

First, Olivier de Schutter, my successor as UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food: There would not have been any food crisis without speculation. Speculation was not the only cause of the crisis, but it accelerated and aggravated the crisis. Agricultural markets are naturally unstable, but speculation amplifies the brutal increases in prices. . . . Speculation makes it difficult to plan production and can brutally increase the cost of food for countries that import food products.

Heiner Flassbeck was secretary of state in the finance ministry under Minister Oskar Lafontaine in the first administration of Chancellor Gerhard Schröder from 1998 to 1999. Today he is Chief of Macroeconomics and Development at UNCTAD in Geneva, and also the acting director of UNCTAD's Division on Globalization and Development Strategies. He is one of the most influential economists on the planet. Together with more than a hundred collaborators, he directs the most important research unit in the entire UN system. According to a report released by UNCTAD, prepared by Flassbeck's team:

The impact of the sub-prime crisis has spread well beyond the United States, causing a widespread squeeze in liquidity and credit. And price hikes in primary commodities, fuelled partly by speculation that has shifted from financial instruments to commodity markets, adds to the challenge for policymakers intent on avoiding a recession while at the same time keeping inflation under control.

In January 2011, at its annual meeting in Davos, in the Swiss canton of Les Grisons, the World Economic Forum (WEF) classified the rise in primary commodity prices, especially food commodities, as one of the five greatest threats to well-being confronting the world's nations, together with cyberwarfare and the possession by terrorists of weapons of mass destruction.

Klaus Schwab, founder of the Forum, has an astute—and profitable—system for deciding who is allowed admission to it.

The Forum is essentially a club of the world's one thousand richest corporations. As the WEF itself says,

Our members represent the 1,000 leading companies and 200 smaller businesses—many from the developing world.... Our members are influential, talented and powerful people....

In addition to supporting the World Economic Forum's mission, a typical Member company is one of the world's foremost 1,000 enterprises with a leading role in shaping the future of its industry or region, a solid projected growth potential and a turnover of a minimum of US\$5 billion.

Members of this "club of a thousand" pay membership fees of 42,500 Swiss francs (about \$46,000), which gives them access to the WEF's meetings. Among them, the tiger sharks are, obviously, numerous. Does the hypocrisy of the world leaders who meet annually in Davos have no limits?

Nevertheless, the opening addresses at the Forum's annual meeting in 2011 in the bunker-like Congress Center in Davos clearly outlined the problem of speculation in agricultural commodities. They even condemned, in the strongest possible terms, the "irresponsible speculators" who, motivated purely by the lure of profit, destroy the markets in foodstuffs and aggravate world hunger. There then followed, over the course of the six following days, a string of seminars, conferences, cocktail receptions, and meetings both public and private in the big hotels of the little snow-covered town, to discuss the issue.

But in the restaurants, the bars, and the bistros that specialize in raclette, the tiger sharks refined their strategies, coordinated their activities, and prepared the next attack on this or that food commodity—or on oil, or some national currency. It is not at Davos that the problem of world hunger will find its solution.

Chalmin asks, "What kind of civilization is this that has found no better way than gambling—the speculative anticipation of profit—to determine the price of bread, or a bowl of rice, for people to eat?" Market logic and the right to food are in absolute contradiction with each other. Speculators play with the lives of millions of human beings. Reason alone demands the immediate and total abolition of speculation in food products.

To vanquish all the tiger sharks once and for all, to protect markets in agricultural commodities from their repeated attacks, Flassbeck himself also supports a radical solution: "We have to snatch primary commodities, especially in food, away from the speculators," he writes. The German verb Flassbeck uses, *entreissen* (to snatch or wrench away from), shows that he is perfectly well aware of the tough fight that awaits those who intend to lead the way.

Flassbeck is calling for a specific mandate from the UN, which, he contends, should put UNCTAD in control of setting prices for agricultural commodities on commodities exchanges worldwide. Going forward, under Flassbeck's system, only producers, traders, and users of agricultural commodities would be permitted to engage in trading on the futures markets. Anyone trading a consignment of wheat, rice, oil, and so on would be obliged to deliver the goods traded. It would be further advisable to impose on traders a high minimum level of self-finance. Anyone who would not make use of a given traded good would be effectively excluded from the commodities exchanges.

If it were implemented, the "Flassbeck method" would keep the tiger sharks away from the basic means of survival for the world's poor, and radically hinder the financialization of agri-food markets. The proposal by Flassbeck and UNCTAD is vigorously supported by a coalition of research organizations and NGOs. Their reasoning is summarized in a remarkable report entitled When Speculation Matters by Miguel Robles, Maxime Torero, and Joachim von Braun of IFPRI, who were, respectively, a post-doctoral fellow at IFPRI, the director of its Markets, Trade, and Institutions Division, and its director general from 2002 to 2009.

To oppose this project by claiming that ending speculation on the agri-food markets would amount to jeopardizing the free market is obviously absurd. But what is lacking for now is the will of national governments to implement it.

# 27

# GENEVA, WORLD CAPITAL OF AGRI-FOOD SPECULATORS

Marc Roche is merely stating the obvious when he writes that the battle against speculation "is equally inseparable from the struggle against the tax havens where the hedge funds are domiciled. And yet, to this day, the G8/G20 countries reveal their sheer hypocrisy, covertly protecting the very thing they publicly condemn. . . . Efforts at regulation also collide with the bank lobby."

"Offshore" capital or other financial holdings are those that are held outside their country of origin; 27 percent of all offshore holdings are held in Switzerland. Fiscal legislation varies from canton to canton in the Swiss confederation. In Zoug, for example, holding companies pay only 0.02 percent in taxes; 200,000 are registered in Zoug. Under Swiss law, anyone who has been a resident of Switzerland for at least ten years and has no desire to seek employment in the country (because he or she is retired or independently wealthy) is eligible for lump sum taxation (forfait fiscal in French). The tax is calculated—somewhat vaguely, to say the least—on the basis of the taxpayer's and his or her family's expenditures. In the cantons of Geneva, Vaud, and Valais, idle rich foreigners can negotiate the amount of tax they are required to pay directly with the cantonal government. Despite a few concessions obtained by the European Union and the OECD, banking secrecy remains the supreme law of the land. The Swiss franc

is now the second-most-important reserve currency in the world, behind the euro but ahead of the dollar.

The banking lobby is all-powerful in Geneva. This marvelous little republic, which lies on the Rhône River at the southern end of Lake Geneva, covers 247 square kilometers (95.4 square miles) and has a population of just under 465,000. Yet it is the sixth-mostimportant financial center on the planet. Geneva is also a fiscal paradise that shelters the assets of powerful figures from all five continents. And since 2007, Geneva has become the world capital of speculation as well, especially in agricultural commodities. In this sector, Geneva has now surpassed the City of London. Many hedge funds, whose investment and trading activities rely on anticipating movements in markets—that is, on speculation—have moved to Geneva. One example: Jabre Capital Partners, managed by the Lebanese-born Philippe Jabre, who manages \$5.5 billion. Attracted by the extreme leniency in fiscal matters of its current minister of finance, the ecologist David Hiler, traders in agricultural commodities have flocked to the Republic and Canton of Geneva.

Geneva's banks, logically, finance speculators, making available to them the lines of credit indispensable to the transportation, from one end of the planet to the other, of colossal cargoes of rice, wheat, corn, oil-plant products, and so on. The most powerful inspection, verification, testing, and certification services company in the world, SGS S.A. (formerly the Société Générale de Surveillance), which employs more than ten thousand people just to inspect the world's principal port facilities, is, moreover, headquartered in Geneva. The volume of business conducted in Geneva involving primary commodities, a great part of which involves agricultural commodities, reached \$1.5 billion in 2000, \$12 billion in 2009, and \$17 billion in 2010. In addition, in 2010, the Swiss National Bank estimated the total amount of deposits in exchange-traded investment funds in Switzerland at 4.5 trillion Swiss francs (more than \$4.85 trillion), a sum equivalent to five times the Confederation's entire budget. But only one-third of this astronomical sum is held in Swiss investment funds, that is, in funds whose management falls under Swiss law. The majority of the hedge funds operating in Switzerland are registered in the Bahamas, the Cayman Islands, Curação, Jersey, Aruba, Barbados, and so on, and therefore entirely evade any legal control in Switzerland.

Practically all the Western governments have legislation that restricts the activities of the equity and investment funds registered within their territory. Yet offshore hedge funds are subject to none of these restrictions because the places where they are registered, by definition, have no legislation governing their activities. This is precisely what makes these hedge funds so attractive. They act, to be sure, via a Swiss bank account; in banking jargon, they are "domiciled" in a bank in Geneva. But they are not, I repeat, not registered in Switzerland.

Hedge funds constitute the speculative instrument par excellence. They enable the most flagrantly risky trades—and the most profitable. They practice short selling, the sale of financial instruments that they do not own, and typically rely on leverage—that is, debt—borrowing capital for their own use collateralized with the capital they receive from their investors.

In the jungle of Genevan high finance, competition is tough. For the hedge funds and other agri-food funds, the company presentation to potential investors is critical, involving video, statistical reports, graphs, and so on, through which each speculative fund attempts to attract and seduce clients. The name and the symbols of Geneva, the city of John Calvin—the fountains, the view of Mont Blanc, the cathedral, the Reformation Wall—figure prominently in these presentations: the most important thing is to reassure the potential client, to suggest—and why not?—that the hedge fund in question (registered in the Caymans or Curaçao, and so on) is subject to Swiss law. The political stability of the Republic and Canton of Geneva, the honesty of most of its citizens, the solidity of its institutions, the stony stolidity of its bankers are all convincing arguments aimed at investors, wherever they come from—France, the United States, Qatar, or Australia.

But the reality is something else entirely. The vast majority of hedge funds, as I have said, are not covered by Swiss law. Nor are they subject to the control of the Swiss Finanzmarktaufsicht (FINMA), the country's Financial Markets Authority. The

current president of FINMA (as of January 2011), Anne Héritier Lachat, admits, "We don't regulate offshore hedge funds because the law does not give us the jurisdiction to do so."

There is thus no control over two-thirds of the speculators roaming Geneva's jungle of high finance. And this fills honest savers and investors with despair. One investor, who lost large sums in the jungle of the Genevan banking system after investing with hedge funds speculating in rice, corn, wheat, and so on, complained, "How can it be . . . that financial companies are permitted to work this way, boasting that they are authorized by FINMA, deceiving us, while in reality they escape any oversight?"

The government of the Republic and Canton of Geneva, however, pampers the tiger sharks. Beyond the multiple tax privileges that it extends to them, Geneva underwrites and sponsors the annual conference that they hold in the city. Hedge fund managers who operate in the agri-food sector met on June 10, 2010, for the JetFin Agro 2010 Conference at the Grand Hotel Kempinski on the Quai du Mont-Blanc. (Founded in 2002, JetFin is a Genevabased consulting and conference-organization company catering to the "alternative investment" industry.) JetFin held its subsequent Agro conference on June 7, 2011, in the same venue. "Agriculture today is the shining light in the investors' universe," JetFin writes in its 2011 conference brochure, promising that at Agro 2011, top managers will explain how to "realize higher profits in exciting markets." The conference invitation (and its online list of sponsors) is graced by the red-and-gold coat of arms of the Republic and Canton of Geneva, JefFin's "Institutional Partner."

Once again, the government blesses—and funds—the luxurious tank where tiger sharks from all over the world come to swim. The attitude of the Genevan authorities is almost scandalous. To use taxpayers' money and the prestige of Geneva to pamper a few hundred speculators, including the most evil ones, is shameful. Two powerful NGOs, one Catholic, Fastenopfer (the Swiss Catholic Lenten Fund), the other Protestant, Bread for All, in fact sent a vigorous letter of protest on June 28, 2010, to the Geneva government.

Their lordships did not deign to reply.

28

# LAND GRABS AND THE RESISTANCE OF THE DAMNED

Immediately after the food crises of 2008, many of the countries Lathat are rich in capital but poor in land, such as the Gulf states, or that have a high population density, such as China and India, began to buy or rent land on a large scale in other countries in order to ensure their food supply (in cereals or meat), seeking to make themselves less dependent on market fluctuations and to respond to growing demand at home. With the dawn of a new food crisis in 2011, reports of land grabs increased. This phenomenon, added to the growth in purchases of land for the purposes of speculation, confirms that land has become a safe investment, a refuge asset, often more profitable than gold. And in fact, with the price of land on average thirty times lower in developing countries than in the countries of the North, land is an investment that really pays off. Moreover, because the international community has decided not to protect the rights of local populations anytime soon, buying up land for speculative purposes has bright days ahead.

In Africa, in 2010, 41 million hectares (141.3 million acres) of arable land were bought, rented, or acquired without compensation by American hedge funds, European banks, and the sovereign wealth funds of Saudi Arabia, South Korea, Singapore, China, and other countries. The example of South Sudan is particularly instructive. After a war of liberation that lasted twenty-six years

and left more than a million dead and wounded, the new state of South Sudan was born on July 9, 2011. But even before the republic's founding, the provisional government in Juba, its capital city, had sold off 600,000 hectares (1.48 million acres) of arable land to the Texas-based Nile Trading and Development, Inc.—1 percent of the nation's territory—for the bargain-basement price of \$25,000, or about 2 cents per acre. Nile Trading also has an option on a further 400,000 hectares (988,000 acres).

Speculation can also be "internal." In Nigeria, the rich merchants in Sokoto and Kano have in various ways laid hands on tens of thousands of hectares of land use for food crops, most often by bribing public officials. Similarly dubious transactions are common in Mali. Rich businessmen in Bamako—or, most often, in the Malian diaspora in Europe, North America, and the Persian Gulf—are buying up land. They do not farm the fields they acquire, but wait for the price of land to rise before selling out to some Saudi prince or a New York hedge fund.

The speculators who swoop down on land used for growing food crops, in order to sell the land later or to replant the fields immediately with crops for export, use a wide array of methods to dispossess African farmers of their means of existence.

Bread for All and Fastenopfer have published an in-depth investigative report on the tiger sharks operating in the financial industry of Geneva and Zurich. As the report says:

In Switzerland, it is above all banks and investment funds that are involved in land grabs. Thus, Crédit Suisse and UBS participated in 2009 in issuing shares on behalf of Golden Agri-Resources. . . . This Indonesian company is grabbing large areas of tropical forest in order to plant vast areas of oil-palm monoculture—with grave consequences for the climate and the local population. Furthermore, Golden Agri-Resources is included in the funds that the two big banks offer to their clientele.

The same chapter in the report continues:

The Sarasin and Pictet funds invest in Cosan, among whose activities is the purchase of land and entire farms in Brazil with the aim of profiting from pushing up land prices. Cosan has been strongly criticized for working conditions approaching slavery on its sugarcane plantations.

Many Swiss funds, both conventional and speculative (hedge funds), invest in agriculture, such as GlobalAbriCap in Zurich, GAIA World Agri Fund in Geneva, and Man Investments (CH) AG in Pfäffikon. All of these funds invest in businesses that buy land in Africa, Kazakhstan, Brazil, or Russia.

As the report's introduction concludes:

In the context of the food crisis, many developing countries have seen themselves criticized for having neglected the agricultural sector. It would seem that some of them are convinced that renting and selling their land constitutes a solution to promoting agriculture, regardless of the grave social, economic, and ecological consequences.

The seizure of land by speculators causes the same social consequences as the acquisition of land by the vultures of green gold. Whether they involve the Libyans in Mali, the Chinese in Ethiopia, or the Saudis and the French in Senegal, such land grabs are clearly detrimental to local populations, and are often accomplished without the people even being consulted beforehand. Entire families are deprived of access to natural resources and driven off their land. When the multinationals do not install their own contingents of workers on-site, a small part of the local population will be able to find work, but for starvation wages and in working conditions that are often inhumane. Most of the time, families are evicted from their ancestral lands; their kitchen gardens and their orchards are soon destroyed, while promises of fair compensation evaporate. And with the eviction of small farmers, it is the food security of thousands of people that is put in danger.

There is also an ancestral know-how, transmitted from generation to generation, that disappears: the understanding of the soil, the slow process of selecting the right seed to suit each plot of land and the amount of sunshine and rain that it receives—all this is swept away in a matter of a few days. In its place, the agrifood corporations plant monocultures of hybridized or genetically modified plants, cultivated according to the systems of industrialized agriculture. The companies enclose the parcels of land in such a way that farmers and nomadic pastoralists no longer even have access to local river shoreline, forest, and pasturage.

Speculating on food products, speculating on land, the traders are in fact speculating on death.

The big multinational French companies active in Africa, such as Bolloré, Vilgrain, and others, boast about the benefits they bring to local populations by investing in their land: construction of infrastructure (roads, irrigation systems, and so on), employment opportunities, increases in national production, knowledge and technology transfer, and so on. In the words of Alexandre Vilgrain, president of CIAN (Conseil Français des Investisseurs en Afrique; French Council of Investors in Africa),

We might consider that the countries of the South judge the countries of the North, and France in particular, much less on their policies of development aid than on the policies of their businesses that invest locally. . . .

The African continent, where our businesses have a long and deep experience, and for the most part, a common language, is becoming a playing field for global investors.

Our country, and therefore our businesses, have every chance of success there, on the condition that we make more of a team effort.

Vilgrain's "playing field" is Africa's field of desolation. The pillaging of the continent is accompanied by an impressive media blitz—the pillagers enjoy "communicating." Yet in order to

cover up their misdeeds, they sometimes invent phrases that are right on target. Among those that get the most use is the famous "win-win." Setting up a win-win relationship, based on satisfying the needs of both parties, makes it possible to resolve conflicts. A win-win agreement is one that enables each party to maximize its interests, and increases the each partner's profits. In short, in losing their land, farmers ensure themselves of many advantages, just like the agri-food corporations that steal the land from them! Thus speculation, so to speak, contributes to the common good and general happiness.

The World Social Forum held in Dakar in February 2011 confirmed that Africa has a civil society of extraordinary vitality. From one end of the continent to the other, people are organizing the resistance to the tiger sharks. Consider the following examples.

SOSUCAM, the Société Sucrière du Cameroun (Cameroon Sugar Company), which belongs to Vilgrain, owns thousands of hectares of land in Cameroon, which is, with Sierra Leone, one of the most corrupt countries on the continent. According to CODEN (Comité de Développement de la Région de N'do; the Committee for the Development of the N'do Region), a Cameroonian coalition of farmers' unions, churches, and other civil society organizations, SOSUCAM signed a ninety-nineyear lease in 1965 with the national government to develop 10,058 hectares (24,854 acres). (SOSUCAM agreed to pay indemnities to the dispossessed farmers, but never did.) In 2006, a second lease added 11,980 hectares (29,603 acres) to the company's holdings. This time, SOSUCAM agreed to pay an annual indemnity to the affected communities, but in the amount of only 2,062,985 CFA francs (\$3,944.50 at the average 2006 exchange rate)—the equivalent of about \$6.25 per family annually. About six thousand people live on the cropland acquired by SOSUCAM. It is of course useless to point out that they were given no chance to have a say regarding the two transactions, which were concluded between Vilgrain and officials in the capital city, Yaoundé.

According to the resistors, SOSUCAM's increase in its land holdings is at the expense of rural communities that are seeing their food security threatened. Furthermore, working conditions in the plantations are disgraceful and dangerous.

"First they took our land without asking us. The parcels that remain to us are not sufficient to feed our families and our harvests have been altered by the insane level of herbicide use on the plantations. SOSUCAM has even forbidden us to keep livestock...," says Michel Essindi, a farmer and member of CODEN....

The most fertile land, formerly used for growing food crops, is now off-limits. Pollution of the air, soil, and water caused by sugarcane processing, makes our crops rot in the ground, reducing production for local markets. . . . The consequences of the company's activities are thus catastrophic and it seems to have total control over the region. . . .

Only 4 percent of SOSUCAM's employees are former farmers who have lost their land. As workers on the plantations, they do not earn enough to meet their own needs and those of their families. . . . Furthermore, both plantation workers and villagers suffer from the environmental consequences of sugar production and processing. . . .

The parent company of SOSUCAM is the SOMDIAA Group, which has been run by the Vilgrain family since 1947. The Vilgrain family also runs the Grands Moulins de Paris, a leading European milling company and the springboard for their agroindustrial venture in Africa. SOMDIAA notably owns three flour mills, in Cameroon, Gabon, and Réunion; eight sugar plants in various parts of Africa; and tens of thousands of hectares of land in many countries. On SOMDIAA's website, you could until recently find the following edifying sentiment: "human values are the very foundation of the Group."

The mobilization of farmers, union members, religious communities, and urban community organizers united in CODEN has succeeded in preventing Vilgrain and the Cameroonian

government from signing a third contract that would have entailed a new round of land plunder and another forced exodus of farming families.

Another example: Benin.

The majority of Benin's 8 million citizens are farmers working small or medium-size holdings, parcels of one or two hectares (2.5 to 5 acres). A third of Benin's people live in extreme poverty, that is, on an income of \$1.25 per day or less. Undernutrition affects more than 20 percent of the population.

In Benin, it was originally native Beninese large landowners with close ties to the government who engaged in land grabbing. Threatened with starving to death, farmers sold their lands, often for laughable prices—for a mouthful of manioc. The barons of Benin today continue to operate in the same fashion: "the current prices [for land] are relatively low and the money that the farmers get in exchange for their land is quickly spent. But their means of existence and their source of food is lost forever." The barons accumulate land but let it lie fallow, waiting for prices to rise before selling it again. In short, just as on the real estate market in any European city, the speculators buy, sell, then buy again, then sell again, always exchanging the same properties in anticipation of ever-higher profits.

The Zou region was formerly the breadbasket of Benin, its main wheat-producing area. Today, Zou has the highest level in the country of seriously undernourished children under five. Instead of investing in subsistence agriculture—or in other words, instead of supporting farmers in securing supplies of fertilizers, water, seed, draft animals or farm machinery, and tools, and developing the country's road infrastructure—the national government prefers to import rice from Asia and wheat from Nigeria, which further undermines local farmers.

A former banker close to the foreign "investors," especially the French, Boni Yayi (also known as Thomas Yayi Boni) was elected president of the republic in 2006. On March 13, 2011, he was reelected. On the evening of his victory, Yayi's spokesman

warmly thanked the French PR agency Euro RSCG for its "precious support." Euro RSCG is an affiliate of the Bolloré group. In 2009, Bolloré received from Boni a concession for the port of Cotonou. In 2011, throughout the country's seventy-seven communes, Euro RSCG organized the banker-president's reelection campaign, to the tune of millions of euros. The previous year, "foreign donors" (including Bolloré) had financed the development of Benin's LEPI (Liste Électorale Permanente Informatisée; Computerized Permanent Electoral List), which cost 28 million euros (about \$37 million in 2010). The opposition had vigorously criticized the LEPI. At least 200,000 potential voters, they said, had been excluded, notably in the southern part of the country, where opposition to Yayi was apparently the strongest. However, Yayi was reelected by a margin of 500,000 votes (with 3.6 million registered voters).

Nestor Mahinou, a leading figure in SYNPA (Association Synergie Paysanne; Farmers' Synergy Association) sums up the disastrous situation of Beninese farmers: "While local small farmers are forced to sell their land because they don't have the means to cultivate it, the vast areas of fertile land bought up by third parties lie fallow." SYNPA, founded in 2000 in Cotonou, is Benin's most powerful movement for the defense of farmers who have had their lands confiscated. With support from ROPPA and its president, Mamadou Cissokho, SYNPA leads an exemplary struggle against the neocolonial system in Benin.

Some sovereign wealth funds, belonging to Asian and African countries, among others, behave no more honestly than private speculators. The example of the Libyan-African Portfolio (LAP) is instructive.

In 2008, the fund was "offered" 100,000 hectares (247,105 acres) of irrigable rice-growing land by the Malian government. In order to exploit this opportunity, the LAP incorporated a private company in-country under Malian law named Malibya, which would enjoy the use of its Malian land holdings for a renewable term of fifty years, without paying any identifiable compensation.

In Mali, water is a critical challenge for agriculture; less than 10 percent of the country's arable land is irrigated. Yet Malibya's contract gives the company unlimited use of "the waters of the Niger River during the rainy season" and of the "necessary quantity of water" the rest of the time. An irrigation canal 14 kilometers (8.7 miles) long, already built and watering 25,000 hectares (61,776 acres) now under Libyan control, is already causing serious problems for farmers and nomads in central Mali. The canal is causing farmers' wells and ponds used by nomadic Fula nomads and their livestock to dry up. Between their migrations, the nomads normally grow sorghum in fields that used to have moist soil but which today are dry.

Mamadou Goïta is one of the principal leaders of ROPPA. Together with his colleagues, especially Tiébilé Dramé, Goïta succeeded in 2008 in compelling the Malian government to publish the contract it had signed with the Libyans. Says Goïta, "The Libyans behave as if they were in conquered territory, as if the land were a desert, even though thousands of Malians live here." Drame adds that the "run on agricultural land in Mali [by foreigners] exacerbates conflicts at the same time as the country is having difficulty in feeding its population. . . . For generations, families have grown millet and rice on these lands. . . . What will become of these people? . . . Those who resist are taken in for questioning, and some are imprisoned."

To the farmers' unions that protest evictions without compensation, Abdalilah Youssef, Malibya's director general, replies with exquisite politeness—and incredible bad faith, saying that he understands "the necessity of reorganizing the local population, that is to say, the villages that are going to leave the area." Goïta and his colleagues have no confidence in the "reorganization of the populations" proposed by Youssef. They are demanding the annulment of the contract with the Libyans, pure and simple. So far, in vain.

The instances of resistance on the part of farmers in Cameroon, Benin, and Mali are exemplary. Here is one more. By constructing the gigantic Diama dam (completed in 1986) on the Senegal River, about 40 kilometers (25 miles) upstream from Saint-Louis, the country of Senegal gained tens of thousands of hectares of arable land. A large part of this new farmland is to-day monopolized by the Grands Domaines du Sénégal (GDS). In Senegal, any multinational company, foreign investor, and so on may acquire 20,000 hectares (49,421 acres) or more, so long as it enjoys useful relationships in the capital city, Dakar. Leases may be of unlimited duration, with an exemption from taxation for ninety-nine years.

For the members of the farmers' union of the rural community of Ross Béthio who met me and my team during our visit there in 2009, the GDS constitutes an enemy wreathed in mystery. The GDS belongs to investment groups in Spain, France, Morocco, and so on. The company produces, partly in greenhouses, sweet corn, onions, bananas, melons, green beans, tomatoes, green peas, strawberries, and grapes. On average, 98 percent of its produce is exported by ship through the nearby port of Saint-Louis directly to Europe. The GDS benefits from its "vertically integrated" supply chain: the company's plantings lie in the irrigated floodplain along the banks of the Senegal River in the Walo region. Their own ships (or ships that they lease) transport the produce. In Mauritania and in Europe, the GDS maintains facilities for ripening fruit. The financial groups that own the GDS are in many cases the principal stockholders in French supermarket chains.

Walo is dotted with immense greenhouses sheathed in brown plastic equipped with mechanical watering systems. Despite agronomist Adama Faye's connections in the prefecture in Saint-Louis, we do not succeed in gaining access to any of the GDS's facilities, which are protected by armed guards in blue uniforms, metal fencing four meters (13 feet) high, video surveillance cameras, and so forth. We are stopped in front of the entrance to one of the most gigantic GDS facilities, which belongs to a French fruit company, La Fruitière de Marseille. We negotiate by electronic means with a director barricaded in an administrative

building whose outlines we can glimpse in the distance. He has a strong Spanish accent. "You do not have authorization for a visit . . . sorry. . . . Yes, not even the UN can do anything about it. . . . The prefect in Saint-Louis? . . . He has no jurisdiction here. . . . You have to apply to our offices in Paris or Marseilles." In short, none of us will get in.

I use a tactic that has worked for me on other occasions: I don't move. I wait for hours in front of the padlocked gate while the guards give us the evil eye. Finally, toward evening, an Audi Quattro drives up, arriving on the paved road that leads to Saint-Louis. A young French technician who seems friendly, and who it turns out has just started working at the GDS, stops in front of the gate. I approach his vehicle. He defends his employer heatedly: "We pay the surveying costs. . . ." Then, a little later: "Many of our fields are on elevated land, at an altitude of twelve or fifteen meters [40–50 feet]. To water them, you need motorized pumps. Senegalese farmers don't have any. . . . We don't pay taxes? That's not true! We employ young people from the villages. The Senegalese government collects taxes on their incomes." End of conversation.

Situated about 50 kilometers (30 miles) from Saint-Louis on the road to Mali, Ross Béthio is home to more than six thousand cooperative farmers. Djibril Diallo, a warmhearted man in his fifties with bright eyes and a receding hairline who wears a brown djellaba, is the executive secretary of the farmers' union. When we meet, he is surrounded by the members of his committee, four men and three women. The farmers of Walo harvest rice twice a year. But the harvests are modest—1 hectare yields only 6 tons of paddy (threshed, unmilled rice)—and the prices paid by the merchants who come from Dakar to take the rice away in their trucks are low. In 2010, an 80-kilogram (176-pound) sack went for 7,500 CFA francs (\$15).

Diallo Sall, Diallo's adjunct, is a lively young man, ironic, impatient. Interrupting Diallo's rather lengthy welcoming speech, he exclaims, "Our wives, our young people go out in the rice fields without having eaten first. In the fields, they eat wild fruit. . . . If

we tell the health worker about this, he replies, 'You're up against power, you are their opponents."

Despite their modest means, the hospitality of the Senegalese is lavish. A table is laid in the hut that serves as the headquarters of the union's leadership committee, near the local mosque. Fans squeak and creak. A delicious aroma escapes from the kitchen. Grilled carp caught in the river, onions, chicken, and potatoes are waiting for us in big metal bowls.

The rice farmers of Ross Béthio are fighters. The savvy way in which they go about their campaign of resistance impresses me. Their union is affiliated with ROPPA and, on a global level, with La Via Campesina. For the farmers, the GDS is beyond reach. But the subprefect and the prefect in Walo and several government ministers in Dakar are targets they could hit.

The alienation of land in Senegal proceeds as follows. Rural land belongs to no one, and therefore lies in the hands of the state. There is no system of land registration. But farming communities posses an unlimited right of usufruct (the right of free use and enjoyment so long as the land is not damaged or destroyed) over the lands they occupy, a right proceeding from immemorial custom. The government has created an institution particularly intended to act in such matters, the rural councils. These are obviously dependent upon the party in power in Dakar. Their jurisdiction is important: they are responsible for boundary marking; that is, they undertake the drawing of boundaries on rural land previously held by the state and used as commons. They assign surveyed and enclosed land to its new proprietors.

The charges drawn up by the Ross Béthio farmers' union are serious but well documented: the confiscation of land for the benefit of the GDS relies upon secret negotiations that take place in Dakar. The rural councils responsible for determining the land's boundaries—that is, for alienating land to the benefit of the GDS—take their orders from the government. The surveyed boundaries are recorded in an official document that must be validated first by the local subprefect, then by the prefect, and finally by a minister. Yet the union contends that some federal

officials responsible for validating the boundaries, and even some government ministers in Dakar, have added to the amount of alienated land several thousand hectares intended for their own private use. A rural council determines the boundaries of a given area of arable land and assigns it to a given GDS installation. As the document confirming the transfer makes its way through the bureaucratic jungle, the amount of land stolen from the farmers keeps increasing.

Who profits from the farmers' dispossession? According to the union, it is above all the GDS that profits, of course, but also—and to varying degrees—certain subprefects, certain prefects, certain ministers, and many of their friends. By mobilizing mass opposition to the land grabs, by increasing their public declarations on the international stage, and by initiating legal proceedings in Senegalese courts, Diallo, Sall, and the members of their union, who farm rice, vegetables, and fruit and raise livestock in Walo, are fighting the destruction of their livelihood—with a determination and courage that compel admiration.

29

# THE COMPLICITY OF THE WESTERN STATES

The ideologues at the World Bank are infinitely more dangerous than the PR hacks who work for Bolloré, Vilgrain, and company. With hundreds of millions of dollars in credits and subsidies, the World Bank in effect finances the theft of arable land in Africa, Asia, and Latin America.

For Africa, the World Bank's ideologues have developed the following theory to justify this program of theft: On 1 hectare planted with millet, farmers in Benin, Burkina Faso, Niger, Chad, or Mali harvest only 600 to 700 kilograms of grain per year (536 to 625 pounds per acre) in normal weather—and "normal" weather is rare. In Europe, however, as I have said, 1 hectare produces 10 tons of wheat. Therefore, it is more worthwhile to entrust to the tender care of the agri-food conglomerates—with their capital resources, their skilled technicians, their marketing and distribution networks—the land from which the poor Africans are incapable of extracting higher yields.

For most of the Western ambassadors sitting on the UN Human Rights Council, the World Bank's word is gospel. I remember Friday, March 18, 2011, in the main hall of the Human Rights Section, on the first floor of the east wing of the United Nations building in Geneva. Davide Zaru is a young Italian jurist with a lively intellect, a confirmed talent for diplomacy, and

a total commitment to the right to food. He is currently international relations officer at the Human Rights Unit of the European Commission, Directorate-General for External Relations, in Brussels, which is directed by Catherine Ashton, Baroness Ashton of Upholland, a British Labour politician who in 2009 became the European Union's High Representative of the Union for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy. When the UNHRC is in session, Zaru stays in Geneva. At the UN, it is his job to coordinate the votes of those among the twenty-seven member states of the European Union whose representatives sit on the council. That morning, Zaru had a desperate air. "I can't help you!" he cried. "Explain my situation to our friends in La Via Campesina. In its current form, the resolution will not pass. The Western countries are absolutely opposed to it. They don't want a convention on the protection of the rights of farmers."

Supported by numerous confederations of farmers' unions, NGOs, and governments of countries in the southern hemisphere, the Human Rights Consultative Committee of the UNHRC had, over the course of three years, developed a report on the protection of the rights of small farmers. In its recommendations, the committee demanded that the UN adopt an international convention that would allow dispossessed farmers to defend their rights to their land, seed, water, and so on, against the vultures of green gold and other tiger shark speculators. The resolution was directly inspired by La Via Campesina, and in particular by the Dakar Appeal Against the Land Grab issued at the end of the World Social Forum 2011:

Considering that recent massive land grabs targeting tens of millions of acres for the benefit of private interests or third states—whether for reasons of food, energy, mining, environment, tourism, speculation or geopolitics—violate human rights by depriving local, indigenous peasants, pastoralists and fisher communities of their livelihoods, by restricting their access to natural resources or by removing their freedom to produce as they wish, and exacerbate the inequalities of women in access and control of land;

Considering that investors and complicit governments threaten the right to food of rural populations, that they condemned them to suffer rampant unemployment and rural exodus, that they exacerbate poverty and conflicts and contribute to the loss of agricultural knowledge and skills and cultural identities;

Considering also that the land and the respect of human rights are firstly under the jurisdiction of national parliaments and governments, and they bear the greatest share of responsibility for these land grabs;

We call on parliaments and national governments to immediately cease all massive land grabs current or future and return the plundered land. . . .

The prospect of seeing this new instrument of international law enforced horrified the Western governments, especially the American, French, German, and British administrations, which are often closely tied to the great predators of the agri-food industry. Such a convention in international law negotiated, signed, and ratified by the world's governments would by its very nature civilize the jungle of the free market a little bit. How dare they!

Worse still, the resolution on the convention included a statement of the rights of all signatory states' citizens to their lands and obligated those states to set up the tribunals necessary to make these rights enforceable. Note that, in this regard, the council would have been creating an innovation in international law. In Senegal, Mali, Guatemala, Bangladesh, and other countries in the southern hemisphere, for a farmer to take to court, for example, one of the vultures of green gold or a speculator based in Paris, China, or Geneva, is sometimes too dangerous, or even simply impossible. Local judges cannot be relied upon to be independent, and the adversary is too powerful. The council therefore recognized states' "extraterritorial responsibility." But, as a result, if France signed and ratified a convention on the protection of the rights of farmers, then the French government would be responsible for the conduct of Bolloré, Vilgrain, and companies

like La Fruitière de Marseille in Benin, Senegal, or Cameroon. Dispossessed African farmers and their unions would be able to have recourse to the French justice system. We may better understand why, faced with such dire prospects, the Western governments mobilized all their diplomatic resources to sabotage the resolution initiated by the farmers' unions of the South and endorsed by the Consultative Committee.

The Consultative Committee comprises international experts elected on a proportional basis according to the population of the world's continents. The Human Rights Council, however, is an intergovernmental body comprising representatives of forty-seven countries. For the council to debate the recommendations formulated by the Consultative Committee, one of the member states of the council must propose the resolution. At the sixteenth session of the council, in March 2011, the resolution on the development of a convention protecting the rights of farmers was proposed by Rodolfo Reyes Rodriguez, vice president of the council and the Cuban ambassador to the UN. A brilliant diplomat, Reves Rodriguez is no softie. After volunteering to fight against the South African expeditionary force during the Angolan Civil War, he lost a leg in 1988 in the decisive battle of Cuito Cuanavale. But the obstructiveness of the Western ambassadors forced him to modify the resolution. For the time being, the fate of the new convention on the protection and justiciability of farmers' rights remains uncertain.

# **EPILOGUE**

But where there is danger,
what saves us also grows.
— Friedrich Hölderlin, "Patmos"

The Earth has a surface area of 510 million square kilometers (197 million square miles). Just under 71 percent of that total area is water; 7 billion human beings live on the rest. We are very unequally distributed, with some areas empty and some overpopulated, as a result of natural features (the glacial polar regions, deserts, semiarid areas, mountain ranges, valleys and fertile plains, maritime coasts, and so on) and economic realities (agriculture, livestock rearing, fisheries, industry, city, countryside, and so on).

The first task of the living species that comprise the natural world, plants, animals, and human beings, is to feed themselves in order to live. Without food, the organism dies. The second task is to reproduce. In order to reach maturity and adulthood, the age at which species can give birth to their offspring, and to be able to procreate, to give life to a new being, all creatures absolutely must feed themselves.

It is in order to feed ourselves that we men and women have gathered, hunted, fabricated weapons and tools, embarked on migrations and voyages. It is in order to feed ourselves that we have worked the earth, seeding, planting, making still more tools, and that we have sought to gain knowledge of plants and have domesticated animals. It is, again, in order to feed ourselves that we humans have developed, like animals, an obsession with territory, and determined the limits within which we feel at home, and defended this space against those who might covet it. And the desire of others has always been all the sharper when our territory is richer or contains some hidden treasure, when it offers some particular advantage.

Beyond the first stage of agriculture, in the course of which men and women set themselves to fabricate still more tools, storage containers, and clothing, and to improve their habitat, artisanal production developed. It became necessary to exchange goods, to trade, to travel. The economy and its infinite development were born of the necessity of men and women to satisfy our needs, foremost of which is to feed ourselves and our children. Babies cry when by chance they are forgotten and feel hungry. Crying is their only means of expressing themselves; they will shriek for hours, until they can cry no more. When babies exposed to famine lose their strength, they also lose their ability to express their needs by crying, and their voices are stilled.

Today, half of the children born in India are seriously and permanently undernourished. For them, every passing moment is suffering. Millions will die before age ten. Others will continue to suffer in silence, to vegetate, to seek in sleep some relief from the pain that devours their guts.

In the beginning of human history, taking food away from others was something done by strong men, when their women and children had absolute need of it. But the time when the inelastic needs of human beings must face a quantity of goods insufficient to meet those needs is today long past. And if a billion people suffer from hunger, it is not because the world does not produce enough food, but because the powerful hold a monopoly on what the Earth provides. In this finite world of ours, in which there are no new places left to discover, nor any new lands left to conquer,

the monopolizing of the Earth's bounty takes on new meaning. It is an immense scandal. The lords of the agri-food markets and the agricultural commodities exchanges decide every day who on this Earth will live or die. They are filled by only one obsession: profit.

In 1947, Mahatma Gandhi remarked, "Earth provides enough to satisfy every man's need but not for every man's greed." Josué de Castro was the first to show that the principal factor responsible for hunger and the lives lost to undernutrition is the unequal distribution of our planet's riches. Yet, since de Castro's death some forty years ago, the rich have grown still richer and the poor infinitely poorer. Not only has the financial, economic, and political power of the global agri-food corporations grown enormously but the individual wealth of the most well-off people has seen exponential growth. Eric Toussaint, Damien Millet, and Daniel Munevar have analyzed the trajectory of billionaires' fortunes in the course of the last ten years. Here are the results of their study. In 2001, there were 497 dollar billionaires in the world, and their total aggregate wealth amounted to \$1.5 trillion. Ten years later, by 2010, the number of dollar billionaires had increased to 1,210 and their total wealth to \$4.5 trillion. The total wealth of these 1,210 billionaires exceeds the gross national product of Germany.

The collapse of financial markets in 2007–8 destroyed the lives of tens of millions of families in Europe, North America, and Japan. According to the World Bank, 69 million more people were thrown into the abyss of hunger. In the countries of the South, everywhere, new mass graves have been dug. Yet, by 2010, the wealth of the very rich had surpassed the level reached before the collapse of the financial markets less than three years before.

Who are the great powers in the global agri-food order that today control humanity's food? They are first of all the few global private corporations that dominate the markets in question. These monsters of global trade, with their tentacles everywhere, control the production and the selling of the inputs that farmers and stockbreeders must buy—seed, organic and mineral fertilizers, phytosanitary products (which fight pests and pathogens), pesticides, fungicides, and so on. The companies' traders are the

principal operators on the world's commodities exchanges. They are the ones who determine the prices of food. Going forward, water will also be in large part under the control of these corporations. And in only a few years, they have acquired tens of millions of hectares of arable land in the southern hemisphere.

But the world's economic order, dominated by global corporations, hedge funds, and big international banks, is not part of the *natural* order. There is nothing "natural" in market forces. It is the market ideologues who, in order to legitimate the murderous practices of global capital and to appease the consciences of financial operators, claim that these "laws of the market" are natural, always referring to them as if they were like the "laws of nature."

A multitude of causes are involved in the chronic undernutrition of one person in six or seven on the planet and in the death from hunger of a scandalous number of people. But, as we have seen throughout this book, whatever the causes are, humanity has at its disposal the means to eliminate them. In his famous Elmhirst Lecture, delivered at the triennial meeting of the International Association of Agricultural Economists in Malaga, Spain, on August 26, 1985, Amartya Sen said, "In the field of hunger and food policy, the need for speed is of course genuinely important." Sen is right: there is not a second to lose. To wait, to bicker over means, to get lost in Byzantine debates and complicated discussions—all the "choral singing" that so shocked Mary Robinson when she was UN High Commissioner for Human Rights—is to become an accomplice to the monopolists, the hoarders, the predators.

The solutions to the problem of world hunger are known; they cover thousands of pages of project proposals and feasibility studies. In September 2000, it was reported that of the UN's then 192 member states, 146 rushed to send their representatives to New York to draw up a list of the principal tragedies afflicting humanity on the threshold of the twenty-first century—hunger, extreme poverty, polluted water, infant mortality, discrimination against women, AIDS, epidemics, and so on—and to decide on objectives, targets to aim for in the battle against these scourges. The

**EPILOGUE** 

heads of state and heads of government calculated that, to put an end to all these tragic afflictions—with hunger at the top of the list—would require an annual investment of \$80 billion for fifteen years. And in order to raise that much money, it would be enough to impose a 2 percent tax on the wealth of the 1,210 billionaires that there were in the world in 2010.

But how can we curb the insanity of *les affameurs*, the "starvers," those who exploit famine situations for financial gain? First, by combating the corruption of the leaders of many of the countries in the southern hemisphere, their venality, their appetite for the power that their positions afford them and for the money that those positions are liable to bring. The misappropriation of public funds in some Third World countries, the enrichment of elected officials at public expense, is a calamity. Where corruption is rife, countries are sold to the predators of global finance, who can then just help themselves to the whole world.

Paul Biva, the president of Cameroon for the last thirty years, spends three-quarters of his time at the Intercontinental Hotel in Geneva. Without his active complicity, Alain Vilgrain's conglomerate would not be able to seize tens of thousands of hectares of arable land in central Cameroon. And without Biya's complicity, Vincent Bolloré would not have secured the privatization of the state enterprise Socapalm and would not have been able to seize another 58,000 hectares. When, in Las Pavas, in the department of Bolívar in northern Colombia, the paramilitary killers in the pay of Spanish global palm oil corporations drive farmers from their land, they are "authorized"—that is, encouraged—by the country's leaders. The current president, Juan Manuel Santos, is known to have links to the Spanish companies, just as his predecessor, Alvaro Uribe, had links to the paramilitaries. Without the benevolence of Abdoulaye Wade, no Grands Domaines du Sénégal! And what would the ever-energetic Jean-Claude Gandur do in Sierra Leone without the corrupt leaders who steal land from rural communities for the sake of his profit?

But corrupt politicians are not the main enemy. It would be absurd and pointless to wait for an awakening of moral conscience

among the grain merchants, the vultures of green gold, or the tiger sharks of market speculation. The law of the maximization of profits is a law of iron. But how can we fight and conquer this enemy?

Che Guevara liked to cite this Chinese proverb: "The strongest walls crumble, starting from the cracks." So we must put as many cracks as possible in the current global order that is crushing the world's people, burying them beneath a mantle of concrete. Antonio Gramsci wrote in a letter from prison, "Pessimism of the intellect, optimism of the will." Charles Péguy, whose writings provide the epigraph with which I begin this book, spoke of "hope, this flower of creation" that "dazzles God himself."

Rupture, resistance, the support of the world's peoples in opposing the established order are indispensable, at every level—globally and locally, in theory and in practice, here and everywhere. There must be concrete, voluntary acts, like those in which the farmers' unions in Ross Béthio, Benin, or in the high sierra of the Yucatán in Guatemala, or in the rice fields of Las Pavas, Colombia, are engaged.

In parliaments, in international regulatory authorities, we can decide that there must be change; we can decide to make the right to food a priority, to remove food from the realm of market speculation, to protect subsistence agriculture in the name of national heritage and invest in improving it worldwide. The solutions exist; the plans and projects are already drafted. What is lacking is the will of governments.

And yet, in the West at least, by voting, by taking advantage of our rights to free expression, by mobilizing on a large scale, by going on strike if necessary, we can obtain radical change in alliances and in policies. There is no powerlessness in democracy.

Today, there is a war being fought between the manioc fields and the sugarcane plantations, between family subsistence agriculture and the agro-industrial corporations—a war without mercy. Everywhere—in Central America and at the foot of the volcanoes along the equator, in the Sahel in southern Africa, on the plains of Madhya Pradesh and Orissa in India, in the Ganges

River delta in Bangladesh—farmers, stockbreeders, herders, and fishers are mobilizing, organizing, resisting.

The global reign of the agro-industrial conglomerates creates scarcity, famine for hundreds of millions of human beings, death. Family subsistence agriculture, by contrast, so long as it is supported by governments and so long as farmers can acquire the necessary investments and inputs, is a guarantor of life—for all of us.

The preamble of the declaration presented by La Via Campesina to the UN Human Rights Council during its sixteenth session, in March 2011, warns us solemnly:

Almost half of the people in the world are peasants. Even in the high-tech world, people eat food produced by peasants. Small-scale agriculture is not just an economic activity; it means life for many people. The security of the population depends on the well-being of peasants and sustainable agriculture. To protect human life it is important to respect, protect and fulfill the rights of the peasants. In reality, the ongoing violations of peasants' rights threaten human life.

Nothing less is required than our total solidarity with the millions of human beings whom hunger is destroying. As the words of a magnificent song made famous by Mercedes Sosa implore:

Sólo le pido a Dios que el dolor no me sea indiferente, que la reseca muerte no me encuentre vacío y solo, sin haber hecho lo suficiente.

I only ask of God
That I not be indifferent to suffering,
That parched death not find me
Empty and alone, without having done enough.

# NOTES

Translator's note on sources: In the original French edition of this book, Jean Ziegler quotes from sources published in many languages, almost always in French translation, sometimes his own. For sources originally published in English, I have quoted from the English original wherever possible. In the cases of a few sources originally written in English to which I could not gain access, I have preferred to transform Ziegler's own French translations of quoted passages into paraphrase rather than translating them in effect back into English via French. For sources in other languages, I have quoted wherever possible from previously published or otherwise official English translations. All translations from French sources not available in English translation are my own. For sources in languages other than French and English, in a very few instances, when I could not locate a citation in its original language (and make my own translation) or in a published English translation, I have had no choice but to translate brief quotations directly into English from Ziegler's French text; this might mean in effect that I have made a translation via French from, for example, a Portuguese or Dutch original. Such instances are generally pointed out in the notes below.

I have used "Ibid." only when the source referred to is entirely unambiguous. Subsequent references to a source after its initial citation are in short form by author's last name and short title, with a cross reference to the first, complete, citation in the notes.

My additions within the author's notes (enclosed within square brackets)

NOTES

251

and new notes that I have felt it necessary or useful to add for the English-language reader are all marked: "—Trans."

The French edition of this book includes very few online references for the documents cited. For the reader's convenience, I have added these wherever possible; URLs included without further comment are not tagged as my additions. This book is clearly intended not only to provide information but to inspire action. I hope that readers will find the online resources included below useful.

I wish to express my gratitude to editorial director Marc Favreau and to editors Azzurra Cox and Sarah Fan for their advice and encouragement, and to copy editor Sue Warga and proofreader Susan Barnett for their sharp eyes. Above all, I thank executive director Diane Wachtell for the opportunity of helping to bring this important book into English, and express my solidarity with Jean Ziegler and his collaborators in their mission.

-C.C.

#### PREFACE

- xiv Geopolítica da fome Josué de Castro, Geopolítica da fome (Rio de Janeiro: Casa do Estudante do Brasil, 1951). This book was ultimately translated into twentysix languages; however, it was originally published in the United States with the confusing—and inappropriate—title The Geography of Hunger (Boston: Little, Brown, 1952). The translation's title was clearly borrowed from De Castro's earlier pioneering work on the subject, Geografia da fome: o dilema brasileiro: pão ou aço (Rio de Janeiro: O Cruzeiro, 1946, with several revised editions through 1971; the subtitle means, "Or, The Brazilian Dilemma: Bread or Steel?"), which provided the foundation for the 1951 book. A new, more appropriately titled English edition was later published as The Geopolitics of Hunger (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1977); this later English edition also includes all the revisions and additions de Castro made for the French editions of the book in 1964 and 1973. In order to prevent confusion between these two of de Castro's works and between the later book's two different English-language editions, I have used the Portuguese titles throughout the text except when referring specifically to one of the translations. —Trans.
- xiv whose article 25 . . . nutrition The relevant clause in article 25 reads: "Everyone has the right to a standard of living adequate for the health and well-being of himself and of his family, including food, clothing, housing and medical care. . . ."—Trans.
- XV Without these young scholars... possible For further information, visit our website: www.rightfood.org.
- xv In 2009, there were . . . Geneva See Blaise Lempen, Genève, Laboratoire du XXIe siècle (Geneva: Éditions Georg, 2010).
- xvii alienated by the doxa The term doxa, widely used by French sociologists, anthropologists, and cultural theorists, has no exact equivalent in English.

Adapting the term from Greek philosophy and rhetoric, in which it meant "common belief" or "popular opinion," Pierre Bourdieu, in his Esquisse d'une théorie de la pratique (1972; translated as Outline of a Theory of Practice, 1977) redefined the term to mean all that is taken for granted and unquestioned in a particular society. Thus the doxa encompasses everything in the individual's experience that makes the natural and the social world appear to be self-evident and defines not only what is sayable but what is even thinkable. The concept of the doxa refines the Marxian idea of alienation: in effect, the doxa limits the possibilities of social, political, and economic change by limiting individuals' capacity to conceive of a changed social order. The paradox of the term lies in the user's implicit assertion of a unique exemption from the doxa's coercive power. Where it occurs elsewhere in this book, the term is left as such, since related English words such as ideology and orthodoxy do not adequately render its meaning. —Trans.

xvii "It is not . . . approve of it" Max Horkheimer, preface to the second edition of Théorie traditionnelle et théorie pratique, trans. Claude Maillard and Sybille Muller (Paris: Éditions Gallimard, 1974), 10–11. [For an in-print volume of Horkheimer's essays from the 1930s that largely matches the contents of this selection in French and was published in the same period, immediately after his death, see Max Horkheimer, Critical Theory: Selected Essays, trans. Matthew J. O'Connell (New York: Continuum, 1975).]

xvii "anticipatory consciousness" See Ernst Bloch, Das Prinzip Hoffnung (Frankfurt: Suhrkamp, 1959). [Available in English as The Principle of Hope, trans. Neville Plaice, Stephen Plaice, and Paul Knight (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1986). Bloch's term in German is vorgelagertes Bewusstsein.—Trans.]

#### 1. THE GEOGRAPHY OF HUNGER

- 3 the International Covenant... Rights The convention was adopted by the UN General Assembly on December 16, 1966. [However, it did not enter into force until January 3, 1976.—Trans.]
- 3 The right to . . . fear See the website of the United Nations Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food: www.srfood.org/index.php/en/right-to-food.—Trans.
- 3 "A meagre diet . . . blood" Ecclesiastes 34:21–22. [This translation, from the New Jerusalem Bible (www.catholic.org/bible/book.php?id=28) is closest to the standard French Jerusalem Bible version cited by the author. —Trans.]
- 4 The fundamental unit...itself The term calorie is intrinsically ambiguous and can be confusing. The familiar dietary, food, or nutritionist's calorie is technically termed the kilocalorie (also called the kilogram calorie or large calorie), since it is equivalent to 1,000 gram calories or small calories. The small calorie, which equals the amount of heat energy needed to raise the temperature of 1 gram of water by 1 degree Centigrade at sea level, is much too small to be useful in nutritional contexts.—Trans.
- 6 For the poor...force Peter Piot, The First Line of Defense: Why Food and Nutrition Matter in the Fight Against HIV/AIDS (Rome: World Food Program Public Affairs Service Resources Department, 2004), 4. [This twelve-page brochure is available in five languages at www.wfp.org/content/first-line-defence.—Trans.]

- 6 In Switzerland . . . hunger National Demographic Institute, Paris, 2009.
- 7 The mathematical model . . . complex Regarding the FAO's statistical modeling, I have benefited from the invaluable assistance of Pierre Pauli, a statistician in Geneva's Office Cantonal de la Statistique.
- 7 tens of millions of metric tons of wheat Throughout this book, I have retained specific measurements in the SI, or metric, system naturally used by Jean Ziegler, adding U.S. equivalents in parentheses. With one exception: since measurements given in metric tons throughout are always very large and somewhat approximate, and since the metric ton and the U.S./imperial long and short ton are all very close in mass, I have simply used ton to mean metric ton throughout, and refrained from providing a non-SI equivalent.

  —Trans.
- 8 Bernard Maire . . . model See Francis Delpeuch and Bernard Maire, Alimentation, environnement et santé: Pour un droit à l'alimentation (Paris: Éditions Ellipses, 2010).
- 9 Latest available statistics...2010) Global Hunger Declining, But Still Unacceptably High: International Hunger Targets Difficult to Reach (Rome: FAO, Economic and Social Development Department, 2010), www.fao.org/docrep/012/al390e/al390e00.pdf. See also The State of Food Insecurity in the World: Addressing Food Security in Protracted Crises (Rome: FAO/WFP, 2010), www.fao.org/docrep/013/i1683e/i1683e00.htm, and the FAO Hunger Portal: www.fao.org/hunger.
- 11 The International Fund . . . earth See IFAD, Rural Poverty Report 2009 (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010).
- 11 In view of . . . simple See Jean Feyder, Mordshunger: Wer profitiert vom Elend der armen Länder? (Munich: Westend, 2010). [This book has been translated into French as Faim tue (Paris: L'Harmattan, 2011) but is not yet available in English. —Trans.]
- 12 Anyone who has . . . admiration The organization is also known more simply as the Movimento dos Trabalhadores Sem Terra (Landless Workers' Movement). —Trans.
- 12 food sovereignty "Food sovereignty is a term coined by members of Via Campesina in 1996 to refer to a policy framework advocated by a number of farmers, peasants, pastoralists, fisherfolk, indigenous peoples, women, rural youth and environmental organizations, namely the claimed 'right' of peoples to define their own food, agriculture, livestock and fisheries systems, in contrast to having food largely subject to international market forces" (Wikipedia, "Food Sovereignty," accessed March 18, 2012). —Trans.
- 14 In rural areas... 2005 See UN Commission on Human Rights, Report of the Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food: Addendum, Mission to Guatemala, E/CN .4/2006/44/Add.1 (United Nations Economic and Social Council, 2006), available at www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/4411820a0.html.
- 16 As for the violent crimes . . . increased See The Right to Food in Guatemala: Final Report of the International Fact-Finding Mission (Guatemala City: Food Information and Action Network [FIAN], 2010), www.fian.org/fileadmin/media/publications/2010\_03\_Guatemala\_FactFindingMission.pdf.
- 17 Manila's Smokey Mountain landfill Smokey Mountain is a forty-year-old municipal waste dump near Manila, where some thirty thousand people live, surviving by scavenging amid the garbage. —Trans.

- 17 The Nicaraguan government... \$80) Yolanda Areas Blas, remarks during a side event titled "The Need of Increased Protection of Human Rights of Peasants" at the sixteenth session of the Human Rights Council, Geneva, March 9, 2011. See Jean Ziegler, Update on the Preliminary Study of the Human Rights Council Advisory Committee on the Advancement of the Rights of Peasants and Other People Working in Rural Areas, A/HRC/16/63 (Geneva: Human Rights Council Advisory Committee, 2011), www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/docs/16session/A-HRC-16-63.pdf.
- 17 The geographical distribution . . . unequal All of the graphs and tables in this chapter are adapted from The State of Food Insecurity in the World: Addressing Food Security in Protracted Crises (Rome: FAO/WFP, 2010), www.fao.org/docrep/013/i1683e/i1683e00.htm.
- 22 another 25 million . . . "in transition" The situation is especially serious in many orphanages where, according to some American NGOs, employees allow children to starve to death. One example: in the orphanage in Torez, in Ukraine, 12 percent of the children, most of them disabled, die of hunger every year. See Daniel Foggo and Martin Foley, "Ukrainian Orphanages 'Are Starving Disabled Children," Sunday Times (London), February 6, 2011. [This article appears to be inaccessible on the Times's website but can be read here: www.hiskidstoo.org/news/article-from-sunday-times london. —Trans.]
- 23 Ever since . . . French protectorate Officially a "protectorate," Tunisia was effectively a French colony from the French invasion in 1881 until independence in 1956. —Trans.
- 24 appalling custom . . . do not eat "Affamati, ma a casa loro," Nigrizia, July 1, 2009, www.nigrizia.com/sito/notizie\_pagina.aspx?Id=7872&IdModule =1. [This article is not available in English.—Trans.]

## 2. INVISIBLE HUNGER

- 25 Several million children...year Hans Konrad Biesalski, "Micronutriments, Wound Healing and Prevention of Pressure Ulcers," Nutrition 28 (September 2010): 858.
- 26 Micronutrient Initiative . . . Report See UNICEF/The Micronutrient Initiative, Vitamin and Mineral Deficiency: A Global Damage Assessment Report (2004). The complete range of MI's reports is available at www.micronutrient.org/English/View.asp?x=614&id=473. —Trans.
- 27 About 30 percent . . . life See Hartwig de Haen, "Das Menschenrecht auf Nahrung," conference presentation, Einbeck-Northeim, January 28, 2011. [Although this speech is not available in English, other papers and interviews by de Haen, the former assistant director general of the FAO's Economic and Social Department, are accessible online, including a 2002 interview on food insecurity available at www.fao.org/english/newsroom/news/2002/9703-en.html.—Trans.]
- 27 According to a study... annually "Hidden Hunger: How Much Can Farming Really Improve People's Health?" The Economist, March 24, 2011, www.economist.com/node/18438289.
- 27 Zinc deficiency also . . . children Nicholas D. Kristof, "Bless the Orange Sweet

NOTES

- Potato," op-ed column, New York Times, November 24, 2010, www.nytimes.com/2010/11/25/opinion/25kristof.html.
- 28 "To end childhood malnutrition . . . will" En finir avec la malnutrition, une question de priorité, proceedings of the conference of the same title (Paris: Action Contre la Faim, 2008). [This document appears to be no longer available online; for information on the organization's more recent work, see www .actioncontrelafaim.org/en. The website of the U.S. branch is www.action againsthunger.org. —Trans.]

#### 3. PROTRACTED CRISES

- 29 A country thus afflicted...inhabitants See Paul Collier, The Bottom Billion: Why the Poorest Countries Are Failing and What Can Be Done about It (London: Oxford University Press, 2008).
- 30 All the countries . . . disasters) For a detailed list of the criteria that govern inclusion on the list of LDCs, see "The Criteria for the Identification of the LDCs," www.un.org/special-rep/ohrlls/ldc/ldc%20criteria.htm; the current list of LDCs is available at www.unohrlls.org/en/ldc/25. —Trans.
- 32 The royalties paid...low Greenpeace Switzerland, dossier on Areva/Niger released at a press conference, Geneva, May 6, 2010.
- 33 migrating desert locusts The desert locust, Schistocerca gregaria Forsk., is called the criquet pèlerin in French, a term occasionally rendered literally in English as "pilgrim locust." —Trans.
- 35 The locusts invaded . . . Egypt Exodus 10:14-15, New Jerusalem Bible.
- 38 In February 2005...control See Report of the United Nations Fact Finding Mission on the Gaza Conflict (New York: United Nations Human Rights Council, 2009), www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/specialsession/9/Fact FindingMission.htm. Established by the UNHRC during the 2009 Gaza War, the mission was headed by South African jurist Richard Goldstone. Hereinafter I will refer to this document as "the Goldstone report" [as it is commonly known. —Trans.]. In 2011, Goldstone, under intense pressure from Jewish groups (Goldstone is himself Jewish), attempted to modify some of the report's original conclusions. A majority of the commissioners prevented this from happening.
- 38 As an occupying power... population See the reports of Richard Falk, the UN Special Rapporteur on the Occupied Palestinian Territories, particularly his reports dated June 2010 (A/HRC/13/53/Rev. 1; available at unispal.un.org/UNISPAL.NSF/0/33F2A0A73AB185DB8525773E00525D05), August 2010 (A/HRC/65/331; available at unispal.un.org/UNISPAL.NSF/0/6 9BEC99AF727EAC2852577C3004AAD8A), and January 2011 (A/HRC /16/72; available at unispal.un.org/UNISPAL.NSF/0/A72012A31C1116E C8525782C00547DD4).
- 38 Step by step... UNRWA AbuZayd, appointed by UN General Secretary Kofi Annan, served as commissioner-general from June 28, 2005, to January 20, 2010; she was succeeded by her deputy, Filippo Grandi. —Trans.
- 39 The entire population . . . responsibility See International Committee of the Red Cross, "Gaza Closure: Not Another Year!" June 14, 2010, www.icrc.org/eng/resources/documents/update/palestine-update-140610.htm. See

- also Christophe Oberlin, *Chroniques de Gaza*, 2001–2011 (Paris: Éditions Demi-Lune, 2011).
- 39 On December 27... limbs See the Goldstone report, chap. 6, sec. C, "Data on casualties during the Israeli military operations in Gaza from 28 December 2008 to 17 January 2009." Among the Israeli forces, there were ten casualties, many due to friendly fire.
- 39 The attacking Israeli forces . . . destroyed See the Goldstone report, chap. 13, "Attacks on the Foundations of Civilian Life in Gaza: Destruction of Industrial Infrastructure, Food Production, Water Installations, Sewage Treatment Plants and Housing" [especially sec. A, "The Destruction of el-Bader Flour Mill" —Trans.].
- 40 two successive attacks...water See the Goldstone report, chap. 13, sec. C, "The Destruction of Water and Sewage Installation," part 1, "The Gaza Wastewater Treatment Plant, Road No. 10, al-Sheikh Ejlin, Gaza City." The missile strike caused massive flooding of farmland with raw sewage. The report concludes: "The fact that the lagoon wall was struck precisely ... where it would cause outflow of the raw sewage suggests that the strike was deliberate and premeditated."—Trans.
- 40 Richard Goldstone, president . . . targets See the Goldstone report, chap. 11, "Deliberate Attacks Against the Civilian Population." See also Mads Gilbert and Erik Fosse, Eyes in Gaza (London: Quartet Books, 2010).
- 40 Stéphane Hessel and . . . weapon Stéphane Hessel and Michel Warschawski, speeches at the conference titled Crimes de Guerre, Blocus de Gaza, held at the University of Geneva, March 13, 2011. [Video footage of Hessel's and Warschawski's remarks at the conference (in French) is available from many online sources, including www.genevelibertaire.ch/~taz/archives/1245.—Trans.]
- 41 the manhunts undertaken . . . diaspora See Juliette Morillot and Dorian Malovic, Évadés de Corée du nord (Paris: Belfond, in the Témoignages series, 2004). This book comprises eyewitness accounts collected in Manchuria and South Korea from survivors of the North Korean famine. [Not available in English.—Trans.]
- 41 From 1996 to 2005... people See Jacques Follorou, "Le système de répression politique en Corée du Nord s'est renforcé et aggravé," Le Monde, May 12, 2011; and Philippe Pons, "Corée du Nord: Pénurie alimentaire et jeu politique," Le Monde, May 14, 2011. These articles are available to subscribers or for purchase at, respectively, www.lemonde.fr/cgi-bin/ACHATS/acheter.cgi?offre=ARCHIVES&type\_item=ART\_ARCH\_30J&objet\_id=1156681 and www.lemonde.fr/cgi-bin/ACHATS/acheter.cgi?offre=ARCHIVES&type\_item=ART\_ARCH\_30J&objet\_id=1157024.
- 41 The Kim dynasty...hunger Kim Il-sung, the founder of the dynasty, ruled North Korea, officially the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, from its establishment in 1948 until his death in 1994. He was succeeded by his son Kim Jong-il, who was in turn succeeded by his son Kim Jong-eun in 2011.—Trans.
- 42 Annesty International... freed "Images Reveal Scale of North Korean Political Prison Camps," Amnesty International news release, May 3, 2011, www

NOTES

257

.amnesty.org/en/news-and-updates/images-reveal-scale-north-korean -political-prison-camps-2011-05-03. See also Amnesty International, Annual Report 2011: The State of the World's Human Rights—North Korea, www.amnesty.org/en/region/north-korea/report-2011.

42 Many returned famine refugees...for life "End Horror of North Korean Political Prison Camps," Amnesty International call for action, May 4, 2011, www .amnesty.org/en/appeals-for-action/north-korean-political-prison-camps. See also Morillot and Malovic, Évadés de Corée (see note to p. 41).

42 Amnesty International...months Jack Rendler, "North Korean Prison Camps Grow Larger," Human Rights Now, Amnesty International USA blog, May 11, 2011, blog.amnestyusa.org/iar/north-korea-the-last-worst-place-on-earth.

42 up to 40 percent...feces See Amnesty International, "Images Reveal Scale" (see note to p. 42): "According to the testimony of a former detainee at the revolutionary zone in the political prison camp at Yodok, an estimated 40 per cent of inmates died from malnutrition between 1999 and 2001.... Food in the camps is scarce. Amnesty International has been told of several accounts of people eating rats or picking corn kernels out of animal waste purely to survive, despite the risks—anyone caught risks solitary confinement or other torture." —Trans.

### 4. THE CHILDREN OF CRATEÚS

- 43 Brazil's northeastern states . . . miles) The sertão comprises parts of seven Brazilian states: Alagoas, Bahia, Pernambuco, Paraíba, Rio Grande do Norte, Ceará, and Piauí.
- 44 If he is lucky... midday The idiomatic English translation of bóias-frias is "cold lunchers," though the term's literal meaning is "cold buoys." Bóia ("buoy")—can refer to other floating things, such as pieces of bread or meat in a bowl of soup, and thus bread/meat/food in general.—Trans.
- 44 And there we... bishopric Like all the great dioceses of Brazil, the diocese of Crateús has a sumptuous episcopal palace. But upon his nomination in 1964, Dom Fragoso refused to live there. Born in a market town in the interior in the state of Paraíba, Dom Fragoso died in 2006 at the age of eighty-two.
- 45 listening to Radio Tirana . . . revolution In the Enver Hoxha period [Hoxha ruled Albania as a Stalinist dictator from the end of World War II until his death in 1985. —Trans.], Radio Tirana, the Albanian national radio network, was broadcast on shortwave literally around the world in many languages, including Portuguese.

#### 5. GOD IS NOT A FARMER

- 47 The Berne Declaration . . . aid Berne Declaration, bulletin, February 1, 2009.
- 47 the first of ... hunger For details on the first of the Millennium Development Goals, see www.un.org/millenniumgoals/poverty.shtml.
- 48 In a study... 1:30 Average Yield of Rainfed Crops and Irrigated Crops (Geneva: World Meteorological Organization, 2006). [Although this document is not available online, the organization's more recent publications are available at www.wmo.int/pages/index\_en.html.—Trans.]
- 50 The title of . . . Farmer Mamadou Cissokho, Dieu n'est pas un paysan (Paris:

Présence Africaine, 2009). [This book has not yet appeared in English translation.—Trans.]

## 6. "NO ONE GOES HUNGRY IN SWITZERLAND"

- 51 Jean-Charles Angrand . . . attained" Jean-Charles Angrand, personal letter to the author, December 26, 2010. [The island of Réunion is a French "overseas department" (a region of France with the same administrative status as the country's mainland départments) situated in the Indian Ocean east of Madagascar, with a population of about 800,000. —Trans.]
- 52 "Mothers and babies... matters François Soudan, "Les Femmes et les Enfants en Dernier," Jeune Afrique, February 8, 2010, www.jeuneafrique.com/Article/ARTJAJA2586p003-004.xml0.
- 53 The G8 and the G20... G8+5 The Group of Eight (G8), founded in 1975 as the G6, is an annual forum where the governments of eight of the world's largest economies are represented: France, Germany, Italy, Japan, the United Kingdom, the United States, Canada, and Russia. The European Union sends a representative to the G8 but cannot host or chair summits. When Brazil, China, India, Mexico, and South Africa are represented as guests, the group is known as the G8+5. The Group of Twenty Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors (G20), which includes representatives from the EU and a wider array of countries that together account for about 80 percent of world GNP and world trade and two-thirds of the world's population, held semi-annual summit meetings from 2008 through 2011. The G20 will meet annually starting in 2012, and has announced that it will essentially supersede the G8.—Trans.
- 53 In his memoir . . . career Tony Blair, A Journey: My Political Life (London: Hutchinson, 2010; New York: Vintage, 2011). I refer here to the German edition of Blair's memoir, Mein Weg, trans. Helmut Dierlamm et al. (Munich: Bertelsmann, 2010), 623.
- 54 As for the promises . . . 2009 "At their meeting in L'Aquila in July, the Group of Eight (G8) large rich economies promised to increase spending on agricultural development by \$20 billion over the next three years. Not much of this was new money (probably \$3 billion–5 billion) and it is not clear how much, if any, has been delivered." "If Words Were Food, Nobody Would Go Hungry," The Economist, November 19, 2009, www.economist.com/node/14926114.

#### 7. THE TRAGEDY OF NOMA

- 55 Noma's technical name Noma comes from an idiomatic use of the Ancient Greek verb nemein, "to spread" (of an ulcer). See Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary, 11th ed. (Springfield, MA: 2003).—Trans.
- 56 One important expert . . . Federation Winds of Hope (www.windsofhope.org /en) was founded by Bertrand Piccard and Brian Jones in 1999, after they completed the first-ever nonstop around-the-world flight in a balloon, to combat forgotten childhood diseases. The No-Noma International Federation (www.nonoma.org/index.php) was founded as an initiative of Winds of Hope in 2003; Piccard is the president of No-Noma.
- 57 at least 80 percent . . . death According to Facing Africa, a U.K. charity that

helps noma sufferers in Ethiopia, the mortality rate for noma ranges even higher: up to 90 percent. See "What Is Noma?" at www.facingafrica.org /FA08/content/site/en/pages/whatisnoma/default.asp. —Trans.

- 57 In most traditional societies . . . committed Ben Fogle, in the documentary Make Me a New Face: Hope for Africa's Hidden Children, broadcast over BBC channels several times June 9–July 5, 2010; for information, see www.bbc.co.uk /programmes/b00sqlrg.
- 57 Organisation of the Islamic Conference The Organisation of the Islamic Conference officially changed its name to the Organisation of Islamic Cooperation on June 28, 2011. —Trans.
- 58 Sentinelles Sentinelles, founded in 1980 by Edmond Kaiser to "come to the aid of wounded innocence," is based in Lausanne: www.sentinelles.org.
- 58 Two Dutch plastic...possible Klaas Marck, "A History of Noma, the 'Face of Poverty," Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery 111, no. 5 (April 15, 2003): 1702–7; doi:10.1097/01.PRS.0000055445.84307.3C. This article is available for purchase at journals.lww.com/plasreconsurg/Abstract/2003/04150/A\_History\_of\_Noma,\_the\_Face\_of\_Poverty\_.18.aspx. [Bos and Marck's book, referred to in the next note, also includes a short history of the disease.—Trans.]
- 58 They have learned . . . work See Kurt Bos and Klaas Marck, The Surgical Treatment of Noma (Amsterdam: Dutch Noma Foundation and Facing Africa, 2006), www.noma.nl/downloads/nomasurgicaltreatmentpdf.pdf.
- 59 Every year, some . . . born See Cyril O. Enwonwu, "Noma—The Ulcer of Extreme Poverty," New England Journal of Medicine 354 (January 19, 2006): 221-24, www.nejm.org/doi/full/10.1056/NEJMp058193.
- 60 Medical teams from . . . Laos M. Leila Srour et al., "Noma in Laos: Stigma of Severe Poverty in Rural Asia," American Journal of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene 78, no. 4 (April 2008): 539–42, www.ajtmh.org/content/78/4/539.
- 61 *noma is present*... *Southeast Asia* There are at present no reliable statistics on the incidence of noma in Asia.
- 61 the African regional bureau . . . the World Bank" See Alexander Fieger et al., "An Estimation of the Incidence of Noma in North-west Nigeria," Tropical Medicine and International Health 8, no. 5 (May 2003): 375–483, available at onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1046/j.1365-3156.2003.01036.x/full. Based on particular statistical inferences, Fieger and his coauthors estimate the global incidence of noma at only 30,000–40, 000. They continue:

Although this number is lower than previous estimations of the WHO (140 000), the concomitant global mortality is well comparable with that of diseases like trypanosomiasis, leishmaniasis, acute upper respiratory infections, obstructed labour, multiple sclerosis and appendicitis. All these disorders are present in the yearly WHO reports in contrast with noma. This reflects the lack of a good monitoring system for noma, and the lack of interest for this affection [i.e., bodily condition; disease, malady—Trans.] from the side of public health policy makers both in less privileged countries where noma is prevalent and also of mondial institutions like the WHO and the World Bank.

Though the combat against extreme poverty is one of the current targets of the World Bank, it is not realized that an excellent biological parameter for the presence of extreme poverty in a population is the structural presence of noma. Noma completely disappears from a society if economical progress enables the poorest in their society to feed their children sufficiently.

—Trans.

- 61 Many publications issued . . . noma The WHO has partnered with many other organizations, including the World Bank, on the Global Burden of Disease (GBD) project since 1990, when the first GBD study quantified the health effects of more than a hundred diseases and injuries for eight regions of the world. WHO is currently collaborating with the Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation and other academic partners in a new round of the GBD 2010 study for the years 1990 and 2005, the Global Burden of Diseases, Injuries, and Risk Factors Study 2010 Health Measurement Survey. All the GBD publications and their periodic updates are available at www.who.int /healthinfo/global\_burden\_disease/en.—Trans.
- 62 Swiss Federal Office of Public Health Information in English on this Swiss agency is available at www.bag.admin.ch/org/index.html?lang=en.—Trans.
- 62 Realizing this action plan...have See Olivier Grivat, "Notre but: Mettre sur pied une journée mondiale contre le noma," an interview with Bertrand Piccard, Tribune Médicale 39 (September 29, 2006), available at www.nonoma.org/index.php?option=com\_alphacontent&itemid=51&lang=French (under the heading "Dernières nouvelles").

# 8. FAMINE AND FATALISM: MALTHUS AND NATURAL SELECTION

- his famous work The complete title of Malthus's essay in its anonymously published first edition (1798) was An Essay on the Principle of Population, as it affects the future improvement of society with remarks on the speculations of Mr. Godwin, M. Condorcet, and other writers. In the second, much enlarged edition (1803), which acknowledged Malthus's authorship, the subtitle was changed: An Essay on the Principle of Population; or, a view of its past and present effects on human happiness; with an enquiry into our prospects respecting the future removal or mitigation of the evils which it occasions. The new subtitle was retained in the third through sixth editions.—Trans.
- 66 Malthus revised the work... revising Most of Malthus's substantive revisions to the Essay were made for the second edition of 1803; in the subsequent editions (1806, 1807, 1817, and 1826), most of Malthus's changes were refinements of diction. —Trans.
- 67 Through the animal . . . vice Thomas Malthus, An Essay on the Principle of Population (1798), chap. 1. The Essay is available in several formats from Project Gutenberg, www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/4239.
- 67 Under this law . . . rent Thomas Robert Malthus, Principles of Political Economy, 2nd ed., published posthumously (London: W. Pickering, 1836), chap. 3, "Of the Rent of Land," sec. 9, "General Remarks on the Surplus Produce of the Land"; the entire book is available at oll.libertyfund.org

/index.php?option=com\_staticxt&staticfile=show.php%3Ftitle=2188&Ite mid=99999999.

- 68 the Poor Laws The English Poor Laws had their roots in late medieval law and were first codified at the end of the sixteenth century. The system, which was drastically overhauled by the New Poor Law of 1834, was the subject of considerable controversy in Malthus's lifetime. —Trans.
- 69 "The tribes of hunters . . . other" Thomas Robert Malthus, An Essay on the Principle of Population, 6th ed. (London: John Murray, 1826), book 1, chap. 4, "Of the Checks to Population among the American Indians," available at www.econlib.org/library/Malthus/malPlong2.html#Chapter%20IV.

## 9. JOSUÉ DE CASTRO, PHASE ONE

70 In his book . . . sense Ludwig Feuerbach, Das Wesen des Christenthums (1841; 2nd ed., 1848). One of the most celebrated translations of this book is by the British novelist George Eliot, writing under her real name, and it remains standard: The Essence of Christianity, 1st ed., trans. from the 2nd German ed. by Marian Evans (London: John Chapman, 1854). The passage to which Jean Ziegler refers appears on pages 1–2:

Consciousness in the strictest sense is present only in a being to whom his species, his essential nature, is an object of thought. . . . Where there is this higher consciousness there is a capability of science. Science is the cognizance of species. In practical life we have to do with individuals; in science, with species. But only a being to whom his own species, his own nature, is an object of thought, can make the essential nature of other things or beings an object of thought.

—Trans.

- 71 two agreements . . . Rights The complete texts of these two covenants are available, respectively, at www2.ohchr.org/english/law/cescr.htm and www2.ohchr.org/english/law/ccpr.htm.
- 72 Garota da Ipanema The restaurant's name means "The Girl from Ipanema"; it memorializes the 1962 hit bossa nova song of the same name with music by Antônio Carlos Jobim and Portuguese lyrics by Vinícius de Moraes.—Trans.
- 73 Geografia da fome Josué de Castro, Geografia da fome (Rio de Janeiro: O Cruzeiro, 1946). Although it was translated into French in 1949 and reissued in 1964, this pioneering work appears never to have been translated into English. [See note to p. xiv.—Trans.]
- 74 "The table of . . . fecund" The French version of this maxim appears as an epigraph in the French edition of de Castro's Geopolitica da fome (see note to p. 75). —Trans.
- 74 "If some of . . . fuel" This quotation is translated from Jean Ziegler's own French version of the passage (see the following note). Mestiço is the Portuguese equivalent of the more familiar Spanish term mestizo. Brazilians use a highly technical vocabulary to denote people of various mixed ethnic heritage that expresses different attitudes from those familiar to Americans on the subject of race. For a good brief overview, see the section on "Brazil" in the Wikipedia entry on the term "Multiracial," en.wikipedia.org/wiki

- /Multiracial#Brazil; or for more detail, the article on "Race in Brazil," en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Race\_in\_Brazil.—Trans.
- 74 Documentario do Nordeste . . . race The two books discussed here, which have not been translated into French and appear not to have been translated into English either, are Alimentação e Raça (Food and Race; Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira, 1935) and Documentário do Nordeste (Documentary of the Northeast; Rio de Janeiro: José Olympio, 1937). The latter should not be confused with a book that is available in English, de Castro's Death in the Northeast: Poverty and Revolution in the Northeast of Brazil (New York: Vintage, 1969), which is a translation of a much later work, Sete palmos de terra e um caixão (literally, Five Handspans of Earth and a Coffin; São Paulo: Brasiliense, 1965). —Trans.
- 75 In 1945... Novo Vargas returned to power in 1951 [in a democratic election—Trans.], but, discredited and on the verge of being driven from power, he committed suicide in 1954 by shooting himself in the heart in the presidential Catete Palace in Rio de Janeiro [today a museum—Trans.].
- 75 his scientific work . . . fifty titles About half of de Castro's works have been translated into other major languages.
- 75 "The central argument . . . disabled" Alain Bué, "La tragique nécessité de manger," Politis, October–November, 2008. Bué was de Castro's assistant at the Centre Universitaire Expérimental in Vincennes (later the Université de Vincennes), founded in 1968. Today a professor at the Université de Paris VIII, he is de Castro's intellectual heir and guardian of his legacy in France.
- 75 Geografia da fome . . . Geopolítica da fome For a clarification of the problematic titles of the English-language translations of de Castro's works, see preface, note to p. xiv. —Trans.
- 75 In his author's preface . . . fome Josué de Castro, Géopolitique de la faim, trans. Léon Bourdon (Paris: Économie et Humanisme and Les Éditions Ouvrières, 1952; revised and expanded edition, 1965), 20. [This author's preface is not included in the 1977 English edition of the book and has not been translated into English. —Trans.] The association of Christian economists known as Économie et Humanisme was founded in 1941 in Marseilles by the Dominican friar Louis-Joseph Lebret. This French translation was thus published on the initiative of a Christian movement that strove in this period especially to reconcile political economy with the Church's social work.
- 76 It was in homage . . . book The original French edition of this book is titled Destruction massive: Géopolitique de la faim (Mass Destruction: The Geopolitics of Hunger). —Trans.
- 76 But, although degraded. . . hunger" De Castro, Géopolitique de la faim, 20–21 (see note to p. 75).
- 77 In many of . . . Hunger Josué de Castro, The Black Book of Hunger, trans. Charles Lam Markmann (New York: Funk and Wagnalls, 1967; Boston: Beacon Press, 1969), a translation of O livro negro da fome (São Paulo: Brasiliense, 1957).
- 77 capitanias During the colonial conquest of Brazil, the king of Portugal gave grants of land to the *fidalgos* (noblemen) comprising sections of the coast, with the provision that they in return conquer the interior. The *figalgo* thus became a *capitão* (captain) and the land that he succeeded in taking

- from the indigenous peoples became known as a capitania (captaincy) or doação (grant). Most of the plantations today are former capitanias.
- 78 In 1954...exhausted Miguel Arrães de Alencar, in conversation with the author.
- 79 Tibor Mende worked . . . Shadow Although Mende was Hungarian, almost all of his works appear to have been published first in English, but only China and Her Shadow (Whitefish, MT: Literary Licensing, 2011; orig. pub. London: Thames and Hudson, 1961) appears to be currently in print. Jean Ziegler also notes L'Inde devant l'orage (Paris: Seuil, 1950), ostensibly a translation from an English original, the title of which I cannot determine from the first editions in the New York Public Library or the Bibliothèque Nationale de France; the French title means "India Facing the Storm." Jean Ziegler also notes a work first published in French and not available in English: Fourmis et poissons: Carnets de route (Paris: Seuil, 1979). —Trans.
- 79 René Dumont's key early books René Dumont and Marcel Mazoyer, Socialisms and Development (London: Deutsch, 1973), a translation of Dévelopment et socialisme (Paris: Seuil, 1969). Jean Ziegler also cites two works not available in English: Le développement agricole africain (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1965) and Paysanneries aux abois (Paris: Seuil, 1972). —Trans.
- 79 the Emmaus movement Today's successor to Abbé Pierre's original Emmaus movement is Emmaus International; see emmaus-international.org/index .php?lang=English.
- 79 IRFED... founded in 1958 The institute is now known as the Centre International Développement et Civilizations—Lebret-IRFED, based in Paris and Geneva (www.lebret-irfed.org); a related organization is IRFED Europe (Institut International de Recherche et de Formation Education Culture et Développement).—Trans.
- 80 Lebret mobilized... de Castro See especially Louis-Joseph Lebret, Dimension de la charité (Paris: Éditions Ouvrières, 1958) and Dynamique concrète du développement (Paris: Éditions Ouvrières, 1967). [These books have not been translated into English.—Trans.]
- 80 The murder rate... world Gilliat H. Falbo, Roberto Buzzetti, and Adriano Cattaneo, "Les enfants et les adolescents victimes d'homicide: Une étude cas-témoins à Recife," Bulletin de l'Organisation Mondiale de la Santé, Recueil d'articles 5 (Geneva, 2001).
- 80 Demetrius Demetrio...families For information about Pequenos Prophetas, visit www.pequenosprofetas.org.br, which links to the organization's pages on social media sites including Blogspot (in Portuguese only) and Facebook.
- 81 In his novel . . . continues Josué de Castro, Of Men and Crabs (New York: Vanguard, 1970), a translation of Homens e caranguejos (Porto: Brasília, 1967).

# 10. HITLER'S "HUNGER PLAN"

- 82 half the population . . . 1942–43 See Timothy Snyder, Bloodlands: Europe Between Hitler and Stalin (New York: Basic Books, 2010).
- 82 As soon as Germany . . . satisfied" Josué de Castro, The Geography of Hunger (Boston: Little, Brown, 1952), 249, quoting Boris Shub and Zorah Warhaftig, Starvation over Europe (Made in Germany), A Documented Record (New York: Institute of Jewish Affairs of the American Jewish Congress and World

- Jewish Congress, 1943), no page reference. [Facts and figures throughout this chapter are all drawn from de Castro's book; de Castro credits Shub and Warhaftig with much of his data. All subsequent quotations from de Castro's book are from this, the first English edition. —Trans.]
- 83 Such was Europe . . . camp De Castro, Geography of Hunger, 252-53.
- 83 The "well fed"... machine De Castro notes that "The Germans themselves were really the only well-fed group... The collaborating peoples, who were engaged in tasks of vital or military importance for German security, received a diet that permitted them to maintain a certain degree of labor efficiency." Geography of Hunger, 249–50. —Trans.
- 84 the Reichsnährstand . . . control See Clifford R. Lovin, "Agricultural Reorganization in the Third Reich: The Reich Food Corporation (Reichsnahrstand), 1933–1936," Agricultural History 43, no. 4 (October 1969): 447–61. —Trans.
- 84 Ley declared . . . race" See de Castro, Geography of Hunger, 250–51; de Castro credits Shub and Warhaftig, Starvation over Europe, for this information. [Ley's comments were published in Der Angriff on January 31, 1940. A fuller citation reads as follows: "A lower race needs less room, less clothing, less food, and less culture than a higher race. The Germans cannot live in the same fashion as the Poles and the Jews. . . . More bread, more clothes, more living space, more culture, more beauty—these our race must have, or it will perish." See "How the Germans Are Starving Poland," Polish Ministry of Information, London, Polish Fort-Nightly Review no. 58 (December 15, 1942), available at www.holocaustresearchproject.org/nazioccupation/poland starved.html. —Trans.]
- 85 General Government The full name of the Nazi regime was initially the Generalgouvernement für die besetzten polnischen Gebiete, or General Government for the Occupied Polish Territories. In July 1940 the name was officially shortened to Generalgouvernement. A more correct English translation of this term would be "General Governorate"; "General Government," however, has considerable currency in historical writing about this period. The region was unofficially referred to by Germans as Restpolen—"the rest of Poland."—Trans.
- 85 Curzio Malaparte... Kaputt Curzio Malaparte was a disaffected Italian Fascist sent by an Italian newspaper to cover the war on the Eastern front; Kaputt, which grimly depicts the depravity of the Nazi leaders and the horrors of the war, has recently been reissued, translated from the Italian by Cesare Foligno, with an afterword by Dan Hofstadter (New York: New York Review Books, 2005). —Trans.
- 86 One day the Germans... mouths" De Castro, Geography of Hunger, 251, quoting Else Margrete Roed, "The Food Situation in Norway," Journal of the American Dietetic Association 19, no. 12 (December 1943): 817–19.
- 86 from 10 to 15 grams . . . 2.5 grams These figures specifically are for the Hunger Winter of 1944–45 in the Netherlands; see de Castro, Geography of Hunger, 254. —Trans.
- 87 "the Polish people . . . trees" De Castro, Geography of Hunger, 253, quoting Maria Babicka, "The Current Food Situation Inside Poland," Journal of the American Dietetic Association 19, no. 4 (April 1943).

- 87 The Nazi strategy... Hungerplan See Sönke Neitzel and Harald Welzer, "Pardon wird nicht gegeben: Der Krieg gegen die Sowjetunion und die Verbrechen an Kriegsgefangenen," Blätter für Deutsche und Internationale Politik, June 2011, 112–23, available for purchase in German only at www.blaetter.de/archiv/jahrgaenge/2011/juni/pardon-wird-nicht-gegeben.
- 87 Reichssichertshauptamt The name of this department in the Nazi security apparatus is also, and more commonly, given as Reichssicherungshauptamt.—Trans.
- 87 Thus, everywhere in . . . hunger See Adam Hochschild, "Tug of War: Timothy Snyder Looks East," review of Timothy Snyder, Bloodlands: Europe Between Hitler and Stalin, Harper's Magazine, February 2011, 79–82, available to subscribers only at harpers.org/archive/2011/02/page/0081.
- 88 Historian Timothy Snyder. . . . shot See Snyder, Bloodlands (see note to p. 82).
- 89 Journalist Max Nord...heed" Max Nord, introduction to Amsterdam tijdens de Hongerwinter (Amsterdam, 1947). [This rare and treasured book today commands prices from \$400 to \$5,000. More background about the volume is available at sites.google.com/site/bintphotobooks/amsterdamtijdensde hongerwinter; a somewhat crude "slide show" of some of the book's images is available at www.youtube.com/watch?v=hlvdcO9BtTU. The first and third sentences here are my translations of Jean Ziegler's French translations from the Dutch original; the second sentence is cited in de Castro, Geography of Hunger, 254. —Trans.
- 90 Adam Hochschild points...hunger See Hochschild, "Tug of War" (see note to p. 87).

## 11. A LIGHT IN THE DARKNESS: THE UNITED NATIONS

- 91 One of the toughest . . . war De Castro, Geography of Hunger, 257-58.
- 92 "The case of France . . . machinery Ibid., 266.
- 92 Recovery was...painful See Edgar Pisani's fine book Le vieil homme et la terre (Paris: Seuil, 2004) and, by the same author, Vive la révolte! (Paris: Seuil, 2006). [Born in 1918, Pisani is a French politician and agricultural advocate who, among many other positions, held the post of French minister of agriculture from 1961 to 1966. The two books noted here have unfortunately not been translated into English.—Trans.]
- 92 As a result . . . diet De Castro, Geography of Hunger, 267.
- 93 In his State... fear Links to both the full text and audio of the Four Freedoms speech are available on the FDR Library's website at docs.fdrlibrary.marist .edu/od4freed.html. —Trans.
- 93 They... will endeavor... want From the Atlantic Charter; an excellent, perfectly legible scan of the original Charter document itself is available at www.archives.gov/education/lessons/fdr-churchill/images/atlantic-charter.gif. —Trans.
- 94 When the fighting forces...world" Sir John Boyd-Orr, "The Role of Food in Post-War Reconstruction," International Labour Review 47, no. 3 (1943): 279, available at labordoc.ilo.org/record/421022?ln=en. [This essay, originally delivered as an address in New York City in 1942 (the text of the speech is held in the Orr papers, box 1, folder 3, National Library of Scotland, Edinburgh), was also published in book form by the International Labour Office (ILO) in Geneva and Montreal and was widely read at the time.

- Boyd-Orr was a Scottish physician, biologist, and politician who received the Nobel Peace Prize for his scientific research in nutrition and his work as the first director general of the FAO; he was made a baron in 1949. Boyd-Orr also contributed the foreword to the British and the first American editions of de Castro's *The Geography of Hunger*.—Trans.]
- 95 We have come . . . creed Franklin D. Roosevelt, State of the Union Message to Congress, January 11, 1944, available at www.presidency.ucsb.edu/ws/index.php?pid=16518#axzzlqwjjKTAc.
- 95 Only fifty nations... 1945 Poland, which was not represented at the conference, soon signed the charter, to become the fifty-first original member state. See "History of the United Nations," www.un.org/en/aboutun / history. For the evolving membership of the UN, see "Member States: Growth in United Nations Membership, 1945–Present," www.un.org/en / members/growth.shtml. —Trans.
- 96 ECOSOC For more information on ECOSOC, see the organization's home page, www.un.org/en/ecosoc/index.shtml.
- 96 Human Rights Council For more information on the Human Rights Council, see the home page of the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, www.ohchr.org/EN/Pages/WelcomePage.aspx.

## 12. JOSUÉ DE CASTRO, PHASE TWO: A VERY HEAVY COFFIN

- 98 João Goulart, Leonel Brizola Leonel Brizola was married to João Goulart's sister. Brizola was, like Goulart, a director of the PT and, on the eve of the coup d'état, governor of the state of Rio Grando do Sul and a federal deputy.
- 99 the VAR-Palmares . . . member Rousseff was arrested and tortured for several weeks by agents of the infamous Delegacia de Ordem Política e Social (DOPS, the Department of Political and Social Order) [which had been founded by the Vargas dictatorship in the 1930s and repurposed by the new military dictatorship. —Trans.]. She betrayed not one of her comrades. The VAR-Palmares (Vanguardia Armada Revolucionaria—Palmares, the Armed Revolutionary Vanguard—Palmares) was named after the legendary Palmares, in what is today the state of Alagoas, a federation of quilombos or hinterland settlements founded by rebellious fugitive slaves, which was effectively independent of the Brazilian government from about 1605 until its destruction in 1695. [For a survey of the history and historiography of the quilombos, see João Jose Flavio dos Santos and Reis Gomes, "Quilombo: Brazilian Maroons During Slavery," Cultural Survival Quarterly 35, no. 4 (Winter 2001), www.culturalsurvival.org/ourpublications/csq/article/quilombo-brazilian-maroons-during-slavery. —Trans.]
- 99 In 1972, de Castro . . . environment Paolo Freire, in his Letters to Christina: Reflections on My Life and Work (New York: Routledge, 1996), 238, quotes part of de Castro's address (citing in turn a special edition of Polis, "The Fight Against Hunger," 31):

It is necessary to view the degradation of the economy of the underdeveloped countries as a contamination of their human environment caused by the economic abuses of the global economy; hunger, misery, high rates of illness, a minimum of hygiene, short average life expectancies—all of this is the product of the destructive action of world exploitation according to the model of the capitalist economy. . . .

It is said that in the underdeveloped regions a concern for the qualitative aspects of life does not exist, only a concern for survival, that is, the battle against hunger, epidemic diseases, and ignorance. This attitude forgets that these are only the symptoms of a severe social illness: underdevelopment as a product of development.

—Trans.

- 99 Guararapes Airport in Recife The airport's full official name today is Recife/ Guararapes—Gilberto Freyre International Airport. —Trans.
- 100 Everything leads...contradictory André Breton, Second Surrealist Manifesto, 1929. The second Manifesto is sometimes ascribed to Breton, and sometimes said to have been supervised by him but written by other members of the Surrealist movement. The text was first published in the twelfth and final issue of La Révolution Surréaliste (December 15, 1929), and in book form by both Kra and Gallimard in Paris the following year. This famous maxim has been translated in various ways; the version here is my own. —Trans.
- 100 The Masters and the Slaves Gilberto Freyre, The Masters and the Slaves: A Study in the Development of Brazilian Civilization, trans. Samuel Putnam, 2nd ed. (New York: Knopf, 1956), a translation of Casa grande e senzala: Formação da família brasileira sob o regime de economia patriarcal (Rio de Janeiro: Maia and Schmidt, 1933). [This book was considered revolutionary in its day for proposing that the mixing of races in Brazilian society was a source of social and cultural strength. —Trans.]
- 100 I encountered... Bastide See Jean Ziegler, Les vivants et la mort (Paris: Seuil, 1975; reissued in the series Points 1978, 2004). [This book has regrettably not yet been translated into English. —Trans.]

#### 13. THE CRUSADERS OF NEOLIBERALISM

- 105 Since the publication . . . corporations See Dan Morgan, Merchants of Grain: The Power and Profits of the Five Giant Companies at the Center of the World's Food Supply (New York: Viking, 1979). [Morgan's book is currently available in an Authors Guild Backinprint.com edition (Lincoln, Nebraska: iUniverse, 2000). —Trans.]
- 106 Just ten corporations... beverages These figures are drawn from my report to the UNHRC titled Promotion and Protection of All Human Rights, Civil, Political, Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Including the Right to Development: Report of the Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food, Jean Ziegler, A/HRC/7/5 (United Nations Human Rights Council, 2008;), available in six languages at www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/7session/reports.htm.
- 106 "six companies control... bananas" Denis Horman, "Pouvoir et stratégie des multinationales de l'agroalimentaire," GRESEA (Groupe de Recherche pour une Stratégie Economique Alternative), April 2006, www.gresea.be /spip.php?article476. [Horman in turn credits for these figures the French edition of John Medeley's Hungry for Trade: How the Poor Pay for Free Trade (Halifax, NS: Fernwood, 2000). —Trans.]
- 106 "From seeds to fertilizers . . . food" Doan Bui, Les affameurs: Voyage au coeur de la planète faim (Paris: Éditions Privé, 2009), 13. [Beauce is one of the most

- productive agricultural regions in France, and Punjab a crucial grain-producing region in India. —Trans.]
- 106 In his pioneering book . . . examined See Gerald Gold, Modern Commodity Futures Trading (New York: Commodity Research Bureau, 1959). The CRB, founded in 1934, directs research in the production, distribution, consumption, and price movements of commodities and futures. [Gold's book was subsequently republished in many revised editions and remains widely available.—Trans.]
- 106 "Their purpose is . . . money" João Pedro Stedilé, "De la terre pour tous," in Solutions locales pour un désordre global, ed. Coline Serreau (Arles: Actes Sud, 2010), available at www.scribd.com/doc/48725253/Coline-Serreau -Solutions-Locales-Pour-Un-Desordre-Global-Decroissance-Ecologie -Capital-is-Me-BRF-Mondialisme-Latouche-Bourguignon. Stedilé is one of the principal directors of the Landless Rural Workers' Movement (MST) in Brazil. See also Jamil Chade, O mundo não é plano: A tragédia silenciosa de 1 bilhão de famintos (São Paulo: Editoras Saraiva e Virgília, 2010).
- 107 Cargill is one . . . Farming See Cargill: A Threat to Food and Farming (Washington, DC: Food & Water Watch, 2009), www.foodandwaterwatch .org/reports/cargill-a-threat-to-food-and-farming.
- 107 As the report... fertilizers Gargill spun off Mosaic in early 2011; see Michael J. de la Merced, "Cargill to Split Off Mosaic Unit in Complex Deal," New York Times Dealbook, January 18, 2011, dealbook.nytimes.com/2011/01/18 /cargill-to-spin-off-its-mosaic-unit-in-complex-deal. Merced writes, "The complicated tax-free transaction—worth more than \$24 billion—will also help keep Cargill, one of the biggest American companies, private." According to Mosaic's home page, the company remains "the world's largest supplier of phosphate and potash"; see www.mosaicco.com. —Trans.
- 107 Cargill has been . . . fresh Food & Water Watch, Cargill: A Threat to Food and Farming, 6 (see note to p. 107).
- 108 creates chemical byproducts . . . animals Ibid., 6.
- 108 By 2008, millions . . . crisis Ibid., 8-9.
- 109 In its Country Reports . . . beaten See U.S. Department of State, Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor, "2008 Human Rights Report: Uzbekistan," February 25, 2009, www.state.gov/j/drl/rls/hrrpt/2008/sca/119143.htm. The report notes that children as young as nine have been observed working in the cotton harvest. The content and language of the Uzbekistan reports have hardly changed for years. The most recent report is available at www.state.gov/j/drl/rls/hrrpt/2010/sca/154489.htm.—Trans.
- 109 speculative fever gripped . . . Continental Morgan, Merchants of Grain, 210 (see note to p. 105). Since the French edition of this book was published, Cargill has reacquired Tradax and Continental has sold its trading division to Cargill. Oceangoing cargo ships, called "floats" in the jargon of the trade, generally carry cargoes of around 20,000 tons.
- 110 Cargill also participated . . . crisis Food & Water Watch, Cargill: A Threat to Food and Farming, 9 (see note to p. 107). [Cargill's website currently has links to two "financial services and commodity-trading" subsidiaries, Cargill Risk Management and Cargill Energy and Risk Management Solutions; for Cargill's own account of their activities, see www.cargill.com/products/financial-risk/index.jsp. —Trans.]

- 110 Jim Prokopanko...chain" See the interview with Prokopanko in Benjamin Beutler, "Konzentrierte Macht: Eine Handvoll transnationaler Konzerne kontrolliert weltweit Landwirtschaft und Nahrungsgütererzeugung," Die Junge Welt, November 23, 2009, Kapital und Arbeit, 9; available in German to subscribers at www.jungewelt.de/suche/index.php?and=Jim+Prokopan co&x=0&y=0&search=Suchen. [Prokopanko was at the time of the interview the president and chief executive officer of Mosaic, before it was spun off by Cargill—a position he still holds. He had previously risen through the corporate ranks at Cargill, becoming corporate vice president in 2004. See Prokopanko's profile in Forbes at people.forbes.com/profile/james-t-prokopanko/78965.—Trans.]
- 112 According to the . . . combined United Nations Development Programme, Human Development Report 2010—20th Anniversary Edition: The Real Wealth of Nations—Pathways to Human Development, hdr.undp.org/en/reports/global /hdr2010.
- 112 As Sharad Pawar...alone See the report on debt servitude in rural India released by the farmers' organization Ekta Parishad (New Delhi, 2011); Ekta Parishad points out the paradoxical nature of the gesture: the farmer kills himself with the very substance that is responsible for his intolerable indebtedness. [The report to which Jean Ziegler refers does not appear to be currently available on Ekta Prashad's website; however, its newsletters, reports, books, brochures, and resource materials are generally available at www.ektaparishad.com/media-section/publications. Ekta Prashad is a Gandhian national federation of more than nine hundred organizations advocating for land and forest rights for the poor, India's indigenous peoples, and dalits.—Trans.]
- 114 In its rulings... law Christophe Golay, Droit à l'alimentation et accès à la justice (doctoral thesis, Institut Universitaire des Hautes Études Internationales et du Développement, Geneva, 2009; Brussels: Bruylant, 2011).
- 114 Food Corporation of India For more information about the FCI, which is critically responsible for Indian food security, see fciweb.nic.in. —Trans.
- 115 The anxiety of...hungry Supreme Court of India, Civil Original Jurisdiction, Writ Petition (Civil) no. 196,2001, order of August 20, 2001; the decision is available for download from the Right to Food Campaign at www.rightto foodindia.org/orders/may203.html.
- 116 "Any person . . . situation" Golay, Droit à l'alimentation (see note to p. 114).
- 116 In India, since... government Colin Gonsalves, "Reflections on the Indian Experience," in The Road to a Remedy: Current Issues in the Litigation of Economic, Social and Cultural Human Rights, ed. John Squires, Malcolm Langford, and Bret Thiele (Sydney, NSW: Australian Human Rights Centre, Faculty of Law, University of New South Wales/Geneva: Centre for Housing Rights and Evictions, 2005), 177–82; the entire book is available for free download from the Global Initiative for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights website at 209.240.139.114/resources/esc-rights-library.
- 117 indigenous forest-dwelling peoples The "tribal peoples" of India, often known by the umbrella term Adivasi (a coinage dating to the 1930s with a connotation of former autonomy disrupted by colonialism), are a heterogeneous group of indigenous ethnic and tribal groups formally known as the Scheduled Tribes. There are 645 such nationally recognized groups, many

- but not all living in the country's forests. Informally they are often called the *upajati* (clans, tribes, groups). —Trans.
- 117 Colin Gonsalves . . . Brahmins Colin Gonsalves et al., Right to Food, vol. 1 (New Delhi: Human Rights Law Network, 2004). Before appealing to the federal supreme court, a plaintiff must have exhausted all local avenues of redress.
- 118 And they won . . . . service See High Court of South Africa (Witwatersrand Local Division), Lindiwe Mazibuko and Others v. The City of Johannesburg and Others, Case No. 06/13885, judgment of April 30, 2008.
- of informal agreements concluded throughout the 1980s and '90s among the principal Western multinational corporations, the Wall Street banks, the American Federal Reserve, the World Bank, and the IMF, all of which agreements aim to eliminate all financial regulating agencies, to liberalize markets, and to install "stateless global governance," or in other words, a unified and self-regulating global market. The theory behind the principles of this "consensus" was developed in 1989 by John Williamson, who was then chief economist and vice president of the World Bank.
- 119 Plantu Plantu is the nom de plume of Jean Plantureux, who specializes in political satire. His work has appeared in the French newspaper Le Monde since 1972. —Trans.

## 14. THE HORSEMEN OF THE APOCALYPSE

- 120 to a lesser extent, the World Bank In 2010, the International Finance Corporation (IFC), an affiliate of the World Bank, devoted \$2.4 billion to subsistence agriculture in thirty-three countries in Africa, Asia, and Latin America. I borrow the term "horsemen of the Apocalypse" from one of my previous books, Les nouveaux maîtres du monde et ceux qui leurs resistant (Paris: Fayard, 2002; Points-Seuil, 2007). The IFC's website is www1.ifc.org.
- 120 The World Bank . . . Robert Zoellnick Zoellnick directed the World Bank from 2006 to 2012. The recent change in leadership at the bank suggests that neoliberal orthodoxy there may soon wane at least somewhat. On March 23, 2012, U.S. president Barack Obama announced the nomination of Jim Yong Kim as the next president of the World Bank; Kim assumed office on July 1. The former president of Dartmouth College, Kim is the first World Bank president whose background is not in politics or finance, and the first to have prior experience in addressing health issues in developing countries, having served as chair of the Department of Global Health and Social Medicine at Harvard Medical School and as co-founder and executive director of Partners in Health, as well as in various positions at WHO (2003-6). Kim has announced his explicit commitment to "foster an institution that . . . prioritizes evidence-based solutions over ideology." See "Statement from Dr. Jim Yong Kim regarding his selection by the World Bank's Executive Directors as 12th President of the World Bank," press release no. 2012/398/SEC, April 16, 2012, web.worldbank.org/WBSITE /EXTERNAL/NEWS/0,,contentMDK:23170832~menuPK:3327604 ~pagePK:34370~piPK:34424~theSitePK:4607,00.html. —Trans.
- 121 "The liberalization of . . . crisis" Marcel Mazoyer, address during the interactive panel discussion during the 47th executive session of UNCTAD, Food

Security in Africa: Lessons from the Recent Global Food Crisis, June 30, 2009. See also Marcel Mazoyer "Mondialisation libérale et pauvreté," Alternative Sud 4 (2003); and Marcel Mazoyer and Laurence Roudart, eds., La fracture agricole et alimentaire mondiale: Nourrir l'humanité aujourd'hui et demain (Paris: Universalis, 2005).

122 Laurent Kabila . . . Maniema See my novel L'Or de Maniema (Paris: Seuil, 1996; Points-Seuil, 2011). [Not yet available in French. —Trans.]

123 I was never . . . regard George Moose quit the diplomatic service with the arrival of the neoconservatives in the White House. [Although Moose resigned in 2001, he was promoted by President George W. Bush in 2002 to the rank of Career Ambassador, an honorary post. Since leaving the service he has taught a course at the George Washington University Elliott School of International Affairs, "Reinventing the United Nations," and led a study group on Africa as a fellow at the Harvard University Institute of Politics.—Trans.]

124 One study . . . hunger Oxfam-Institute of Development Studies (IDS), Liberalization and Poverty, Final Report to the Department for International Development (London: DFID, 1999). See also Rigged Rules and Double Standards: Trade, Globalization, and the Fight Against Poverty (Oxford: Oxfam/Make Trade Fair, 2002), www.maketradefair.com/assets/english/report\_english.pdf.

124 Oxfam Oxfam was founded as the Oxford Committee for Famine Relief in 1942 [to campaign to send food supplies to starving civilians through the Allied naval blockade of Nazi-occupied Greece during World War II. Oxfam International today is a confederation of fifteen organizations working in more than ninety countries; Oxfam remains one of the world's leading NGOs in providing emergency food and drinking water, and fights hunger, poverty, and injustice worldwide. See www.oxfam.org. —Trans.]

124 Of the fifty-three countries . . . economies Note that, depending upon one's political perspective, there are between fifty-three and fifty-seven countries in Africa. See Africa Check, "How Many Countries in Africa? How Hard Can the Question Be?" www.africacheck.org/reports/how-many-countries -in-africa-how-hard-can-the-question-be. —Trans.

125 Haiti is today . . . tons Feyder, Mordshunger, 17ff (see note to p. 11).

125 Since the 1990s...catastrophic Sally-Anne Way, The Impact of Macroeconomic Policies on the Right to Food: The Case of Zambia (London: Oxfam, 2001).

## 15. WHEN FREE TRADE KILLS

- 129 aimed to relaunch... since In the WTO's own words, the Doha Round is a process of "trade negotiations among the WTO membership. Its aim is to achieve major reform of the international trading system through the introduction of lower trade barriers and revised trade rules" ("The Doha Round," www.wto.org/english/tratop\_e/dda\_e/dda\_e.htm). —Trans.
- 129 precooked cereal-and-pulse . . . biscuits For detailed descriptions of the special nutritional products distributed by the WFP, see www.wfp.org/nutrition/special-nutritional-products.—Trans.
- 130 A woman widowed . . . liberalism? WFP memorandum, December 18, 2005. [Since the WFP does not offer the texts of all its memoranda on its website, I

have been unable to locate the official English-language version of this document. The translation here is my own, from Jean Ziegler's French. I presume that the memorandum referred to was originally released in English.

—Trans.]

130 In 1943... fronts See Jean Drèze, Amartya Sen, and Athar Hussain, eds., The Political Economy of Hunger: Selected Essays (Oxford: Clarendon, 1995).

#### 16. SAVONAROLA ON LAKE GENEVA

- 134 "I am neither . . . signed" Sonia Arnal, "Pascal Lamy: 'Je ne suis ni optimiste ni pessimiste. Je suis activiste,'" Le Matin Dimanche, Lausanne, February 12, 2011, new.lematin.ch/actu/economie/pascal-lamy-%C2%ABje-ne-suis-ni-optimiste-ni-pessimiste-je-suis-activiste%C2%BB-89076.
- 135 One of his books... markets See Pascal Lamy, L'Europe en première ligne, with a preface by Éric Orsenn (Paris: Seuil, 2002), particularly the chapter titled "Les cent heures de Doha," 147ff.
- 135 Jean-François Noblet For more information on the work of the ecologist Jean-François Noblet, see his website, noblet.me. —Trans.
- 136 Olivier De Schutter De Schutter, a professor of international human rights law, succeeded Jean Ziegler as UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food in 2008. —Trans.
- 137 "We agree to ensure... manner" WTO Doha Work Programme Ministerial Declaration (adopted on December 18, 2005), para. 6, www.wto.org/english/thewto\_e/minist\_e/min05\_e/final\_text\_e.htm.
- 137 The report argues . . . farmers Background Document Prepared by the UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food, Mr. Olivier De Schutter, on His Mission to the World Trade Organization (WTO), Presented to the Human Rights Council in March 2009 (background study to UN doc. A/HRC/10/005/Add.2), January 5, 2009, available at www.srfood.org/images/stories/pdf/otherdocuments/9-srrtfre portmissionwto-1-09.pdf.
- 138 Virtually all NGOs... Doha Round See in particular the "Note conceptuelle pour le Forum social mondial (FSM) 2011," written by the World Social Forum's scientific committee, headed by Samir Amin, in preparation for the Forum's conference in Dakar, February 6-11, 2011, fsm2011.org/fr/note -conceptuelle [in French only —Trans.]. See also the document presented by La Via Campesina and adopted by the Forum's plenary assembly, "Dakar Appeal Against the Land Grab," www.viacampesina.org/en/index .php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=1040:dakar-appeal-against -the-land-grab&catid=23:agrarian-reform&Itemid=36; and, also from La Via Campesina, "Final Declaration of the Social Movements Assembly WSF 2011, February 10th, Dakar (Senegal)," www.viacampesina.org/en /index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=1034:final-decla ration-of-the-social-movements-assembly-wsf-2011-february-10th-dakar -senegal&catid=25:world-social-forum&Itemid=34; and, from the Forum, "Declaration by the Convergence Assembly on Social and Economy and Fair Trade," fsm2011.org/en/social-and-economy-and-fair-trade.
- 138 "The lord . . . mind" Ecclesiastes 28:28, Revised Standard Version.

#### 17. A BILLIONAIRE'S FEAR

- 142 The policies governing . . . FAO See the WFP's Mission Statement, which is prefaced: "In December 1994, WFP's governing body adopted the WFP Mission Statement, the first for an United Nations organization," www.wfp .org/about/mission-statement. —Trans.
- 143 Food for Work For more information on the WFP's Food for Assets program, see www.wfp.org/food-assets. —Trans.
- 144 The two autonomous regions Following the 2008 South Ossetia war, in which Russia intervened to defend the two breakaway regions and Georgia was decisively defeated, the two self-declared republics reaffirmed their independence, which, however, has been recognized by only the Russian Federation and a handful of other UN member states (Nicaragua; Venezuela; and the tiny Pacific island states of Nauru, Tuvalu, and Vanuatu). The vast majority of the world's countries and international organizations continue to consider the two regions to be parts of Georgia. —Trans.
- 148 "Dear Mr. Ziegler. . . succeed" Since the original letters were not available to me, the texts here are my translations from Jean Ziegler's French renderings of Morris's letters (which I presume were written in English). —Trans.
- 150 Exhausted, worn out... 2007 Since leaving the WFP, James T. Morris has served as an independent director of Old National Bancorp in Evansville, Indiana, and as president of the company that owns the Indiana Pacers men's basketball team.

### 18. VICTORY OF THE PREDATORS

- 152 Before 2009 . . . Territories For the WFP's 2009 and 2010 statistics on its school meal programs, see docustore.wfp.org/stellent/groups/public/documents/newsroom/wfp236983.pdf.—Trans.
- 154 It would be... WFP See "Food Aid for Africa: When Feeding the Hungry Is Political—A United Nations Agency Under Attack," The Economist, March 18, 2010, www.economist.com/node/15731546.

## 20. Jalil Jilani and her Children

- 160 Waliur Rahman By coincidence, a BBC reporter of the same name (which is relatively common in Bangladesh) filed a story in 2005 naming the country the world's most corrupt, tied with Chad. See Waliur Rahman, "Bangladesh Tops Most Corrupt List" BBC News, October 18, 2005, news .bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south\_asia/4353334.stm.—Trans.
- 160 Gulshan Ironically, Gulshan is also the name of the wealthiest district of Dhaka. It is obviously important not to confuse the two. —Trans.
- 161 All the peoples... majority Bangladesh is a very homogeneous country, with 98 percent of the population being ethnically Bengali and nearly 90 percent Muslim. The country's approximately one hundred tribal groups include Hindus, Buddhists, Christians, and animists and are mainly of Sino-Tibetan origin.—Trans.
- 162 The legal minimum wage . . . \$11.00 See "Spectrum Disaster—New Info and Demands," Clean Clothes Campaign, April 24, 2005, www.cleanclothes

.org/news/spectrum-update-new-info-a-demands. The fluctuating exchange rate for Bangladesh's currency in this period had a considerable effect on the value of wages for the country's textile workers. From 2004 to mid-2006 the Bangladeshi taka decreased steadily in value from about 60 to 70 takas to the U.S. dollar; the average in 2005, when Jean Ziegler met Jalil Jilani, was 63.75. The currency traded steadily just below 70 to the dollar until late 2010, when it began to fall sharply in value; by April 2012, the taka was trading at about 82 to the dollar. Bangladesh raised its minimum wage for garment workers in 2006 and again in 2010, to 3,000 takas per month; see "Bangladesh Increases Garment Workers' Minimum Wage," BBC News, July 23, 2010, www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-10779270. Nonetheless, according to the International Labour Organisation's Global Wage Report 2010/2011, Bangladesh still has the lowest minimum wage in Asia; see Iminul Islam, "Minimum Wage of Bangladesh Lowest in Asia," Daily Newspaper, December 17, 2010, available at www.cawinfo.org/2011/01 /minimum-wage-of-bangladesh-lowest-in-asia. —Trans.

- 162 Clean Clothes Campaign See the Clean Clothes Campaign, "About Us," www .cleanclothes.org/about-us.
- 162 The CCC has calculated . . . 33 cents Berne Declaration bulletin, 2005.
- 162 On the night . . . rubble See "Factory Collapsed—Bangladeshi Workers Buried Alive," Clean Clothes Campaign, April 1 [sic; should be April 10 or 11—Trans.], 2005, www.cleanclothes.org/news/Bangladeshi-garment -workers-buried-alive. Sixty-four workers died and seventy-four were injured, including many left permanently handicapped. For a series of highly detailed reports on the Spectrum Sweater disaster and its aftermath, including the attempts to secure justice and compensation on behalf of the victims' families, see the Clean Clothes Campaign, www.cleanclothes.org/search?searchword=spectrum&ordering=&searchphrase=all.—Trans.

# 21. THE DEFEAT OF JACQUES DIOUF

- 166 The Lords of Poverty Graham Hancock, The Lords of Poverty: The Power, Prestige, and Corruption of the International Aid Business (London: Macmillan, 1989).
- The Ecologist is . . . hunger The Ecologist 21, no. 2, FAO Special Issue: The UN Food and Agriculture Organization: Promoting World Hunger (March/April 1991); available at exacteditions.theecologist.org/exact/browse /307/308/5643/2/1?dps=on. [The issue opens with an open letter to Edouard Saouma, then director general of the FAO, written by Nicholas Hildyard and endorsed by leading NGOs from all over the world: "It is your policies that are at fault, not peasants or lack of finance. Whether in agriculture, in forestry, or in aquaculture, you have promoted policies which benefit the rich and powerful at the expense of the livelihoods of the poor. Policies that are, in effect, systematically creating the conditions for mass starvation" (43). —Trans.]
- 166 As for the BBC...money "Food Summit 'Waste of Time,'" BBC News World Edition, June 13, 2002, news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/2042664.stm. [This article was published immediately following the FAO's second World Food Summit.—Trans.]

- 167 By comparison... subsidies See The Director-General's Medium Term Plan 2012– 13 (Reviewed) and Programme of Work and Budget 2012–13 (Rome: FAO, 2011), www.fao.org/docrep/meeting/021/ma061e.pdf.—Trans.
- 167 The FAO owes... 2011 [As of January 1, 2012,] Diouf was replaced by José Graziano da Silva, a warm-hearted [American-born] Brazilian agronomist. Graziano is well qualified: he served in the first Lula cabinet as Extraordinary Minister for Food Security from 2003 to 2004 and was responsible for implementing the Fome Zero program [which lifted 28 million people above the national poverty line during Lula's eight years in office —Trans.].
- 171 On paper . . . population See Hans Christof von Sponeck, A Different Kind of War: The UN Sanctions Regime in Iraq, with a foreword by Celso N. Amorim (London: Berghahn Books, 2006), a translation of Ein anderer Krieg: Das Sanktionsregime der UNO im Irak (Hamburg: Hamburger Edition, 2005).
- 171 Thus, gradually... medicine See Hans Christof von Sponeck and Andreas Zumach, Irak, Chronik eines gewollten Krieges: Wie die Weltöffentlichkeit manipuliert und das Völkerrecht gebrochen wird (Cologne: Kiepenheuer und Witsch, 2003). [This work, whose title means "Iraq, Chronicle of an Unprovoked War: How World Public Opinion Is Manipulated and International Law Broken," has not been translated into English. —Trans.]
- 173 "Even if not . . . . war" Report of the Second Panel Established Pursuant to the Note by the President of the Security Council of 30 January 1999 (S/1999/100), Concerning the Current Humanitarian Situation in Iraq (Annex II of S/1999/356, March 30, 1999), available at www.casi.org.uk/info/panelrep.html.
- 173 "Howironicitis... destruction" Hansvon Sponeck, "After the Journey—AUN Man's Open Letter to Tony Blair," New Statesman, September 23, 2010, www.newstatesman.com/middle-east/2010/09/iraq-humanitarian-sanctions.
- 174 "We have heard . . . worth it" The most complete transcript available online of Stahl's interview with Albright is included in Douglas E. Hill, "Albright's Blunder," Irvine Review (2002), available at web.archive.org /web/20030603215848/ http://www.irvinereview.org/guestl.htm. Hill, however, is very supportive of Albright and highly critical of Stahl.—Trans.
- 175 His predecessor...uproar Halliday resigned to protest the sanctions regime, saying publicly, like Marc Bossuyt, that it amounted to genocide. —Trans.
- 175 "This man... speak" James Rubin, Spokesman, U.S. Department of State, daily press briefing, quoted in von Sponeck, Different Kind of War, 4 (see note to p. 171).
- 175 "As the UN Humanitarian Coordinator . . . propaganda" Von Sponeck, Different Kind of War, 211.
- 176 The American bombing . . . program Certain accounts from the oil-for-food program were transferred to the Iraqi Development Fund administered by the American proconsul in Baghdad, Paul E. Bremer. See Djacoba Liva Tehindrazanarivelo, Les sanctions des Nations unies et leurs effets secondaires (Paris: PUF, 2005).

## 22. A GREAT LIE

180 More than 600 million . . . 2011 For statistics through 2011, see Early Warning: Risks to Global Civilization, "Global Biofuel Production," early warn.blogspot.com/2011/03/global-biofuel-production.html. For slightly

- different figures, see "Biofuels" on the BP website, www.bp.com/section genericarticle800.do?categoryId=9037217&contentId=7068633. —Trans.
- 180 world production . . . 2011 See Benoît Boisleux, Impacts des biocarburants sur l'équilibre fondamental des matières premières aux États-Unis (Zurich, 2011).
- 180 The dry regions . . . land See Robin P. White and Janet Nackoney, Drylands, People, and Ecosystem Goods and Services: A Web-Based Geospatial Analysis (Washington: World Resources Institute, 2003), www.wri.org/publication/drylands-people-and-ecosystem-goods-and-services.
- 181 The destruction of ecosystems . . . pastoralists On the causes of ecosystem destruction in Europe, see Serreau, Solutions locales (see note to p. 106); see also the excellent film of the same title (information is available at www .solutionslocales-lefilm.com).
- 182 According, again... facilities See Riccardo Petrella, Le manifeste de l'eau: Pour un contrat mondial, preface by Mario Soares, 2nd expanded ed. (Lausanne: Page Deux, 1999); [available in English as The Water Manifesto: Arguments for a World Water Contract (London: Zed, 2001). Petrella has recently updated his book for the new century: see Le manifeste de l'eau pour le XXIe siècle: Pour un pacte social de l'eau (Anjou, Québec: Fides, 2008) —Trans.]. See also Guy Le Moigne and Pierre-Frédéric Ténière-Buchot, "Les grands enjeux liés à la maîtrise de l'eau," De l'eau pour demain, special issue of Revue Française de Géoéconomie, no. 4 (Winter 1997/98): 37–46.
- 183 Noël Mamère Mamère is a French TV entertainer turned politician and ecological activist, and a member of the French Green Party.—Trans.
- 183 Peter Brabeck-Letmathe . . . Nestlé Peter Brabeck Letmathe, in an interview with the Sunday Neue Zürcher Zeitung, "'Dann gibt's nichts mehr zu essen': Nestlé-Chef Peter Brabeck warnt im Interview vor Agro-Treibstoffen," Neue Zürcher Zeitung, March 23, 2008, available in German only at www.nzz.ch /nachrichten/wirtschaft/aktuell/dann\_gibts\_nichts\_mehr\_zu\_essen\_l .693850.html.
- 183 In addition . . . biofuel See "Biofuel Policies in OECD Countries Costly and Ineffective, Says Report," www.oecd.org/document/28/0,334 3,fr\_2649\_33717\_41013916\_1\_1\_1\_1,00.html; the report itself, the OECD's Economic Assessment of Biofuel Support Policies, and a PowerPoint presentation of its conclusions, may be downloaded from the same webpage.
- 183 "a large-scale effort . . . reduce it" "Priced Out of the Market," editorial, New York Times, March 7, 2008, www.nytimes.com/2008/03/03/opinion/03monl.html.

# 23. BARACK OBAMA'S OBSESSION

- 184 In his State of the Union . . . priority The complete text of President Obama's 2011 State of the Union address is available from the Huffington Post at www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/01/25/obama-state-of-the-union-\_1\_n \_813478.html; the White House's own coverage is at www.whitehouse.gov /state-of-the-union-2011. Both sites feature complete video of the speech. —Trans.
- 186 biofuels...stomachs Among countless other instances, see David Zilberman

NOTES

et al., "The Economics of Biofuel," 24, a presentation to the FAO by a team from Berkeley's program in agricultural and resource economics, www.fao.org/fileadmin/user\_upload/foodclimate/presentations/EM56/Zilberman.pdf. Jean Ziegler cites a Swiss edition (in French) of Annesty International magazine, Bern, September 2008.—Trans.

#### 24. THE CURSE OF SUGARCANE

- 187 engenhos (sugarcane plantations) In Brazil in the colonial era, an engenho encompassed a sugar plantation's entire property: the cane fields, the buildings where cane was processed (the casa de engenho), the landowner's residence (the casa grande), and the slaves' quarters (senzala).
- 189 The implementation of . . . farms Michel Duquette, "Une décennie de grands projets: Les leçons de la politique énergétique du Brésil," Tiers-Monde 30, no. 120 (1989): 907–25.
- 190 One FAO expert . . . plantations Ricardo Abramovay, Policies, Institutions and Markets Shaping Biofuel Expansion: The Case of Ethanol and Biodiesel in Brazil (Rome: FAO, 2009), 10.
- 190 The monopolization exacerbates . . . production See Frances Moore Lappé and Joseph Collins, Food First: Beyond the Myth of Scarcity (New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1977; New York: Ballantine, 1979). [Jean Ziegler cites specifically a French edition of this book, L'industrie de la faim: Par-delà le mythe de la pénurie (Montreal: L'Étincelle, 1977), 213. —Trans.]
- 190 As for rural families . . . discrimination One FAO study specifically examines discrimination against single women heads of rural households and the ways that they have been affected by the implementation of the Proalcohol plan; see Andrea Rossi and Yianna Lambrou, Gender and Equity Issues Gender and Equity Issues in Liquid Biofuels Production: Minimizing the Risks to Maximize the Opportunities (Rome: FAO, 2008), www.fao.org/docrep/010/ai503e/ai503e00.htm. For a summary of the report, see "Large-Scale Biofuel Production May Increase Marginalization of Women: New Study on Biofuel Production Focuses on Gender," FAO, Rome, April 21, 2008, www.fao.org/newsroom/en/news/2008/1000830/index.html. —Trans.
- 191 Ethical Sugar For Ethical Sugar's overall view of the Brazilian biofuel industry, see Ben Richardson, Markku Lehtonen, and Siobhán McGrath, An Exclusive Engine of Growth: The Development Model of Brazilian Sugarcane (Ethical Sugar, 2009); available at www.sucre-ethique.org/IMG/pdf/Ethical\_Dugar\_social\_report\_2009\_-\_Brazil.pdf. —Trans.
- 191 Paulo Vanucci Vanucci was the Brazilian minister of human rights from 2005 to 2010. —Trans.
- 192 According to an estimate . . . 2050 See World Bank, "Assessment of the Risk of Amazon Dieback: Main Report" (Climate Change and Clean Energy Initiative, Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development Department, Latin America and Caribbean Region), February 4, 2010, 58, www.bicusa.org/en/Document.101982.aspx. See also Britaldo Silveira Soares-Filho et al., "Modelling Conservation in the Amazon Basin," Nature 440 (March 23, 2006): 520–23, available to subscribers or for purchase at www.nature.com/nature/journal/v440/n7083/full/nature04389.html.—Trans.

- 192 As David and Marcia . . . families David Pimentel and Marcia H. Pimentel, Food, Energy, and Society, 3rd ed. (Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press, 2007), 294.
- 193 Many live and suffer . . . herd Clemens Höges, "Les esclaves brésiliens de l'éthanol: Derrière le miracle des agrocarburants," Le Courrier International, April 30, 2009, www.courrierinternational.com/article/2009/04/30 /les-esclaves-bresiliens-de-l-ethanol. [This article was originally published in Der Spiegel in German and is available in a slightly different version in English at archive.truthout.org/012409C. —Trans.]
- "Large-Scale Biofuel Production May Increase Marginalization of Women" (see note to p. 190). [See also Rossi and Lambrou, Gender and Equity (see note to p. 190). And see also "The Situation of Women in Rural Areas," in Women, Migration, Environment and Rural Development Policy in Brazil (Rome: FAO, Economic and Social Development Department, no date), www.fao.org/DOCREP/x0210e/x0210e03.htm; and "The Double Work Burden: Work at Home and in the Field," FAO, Economic and Social Development Department, no date, www.fao.org/DOCREP/x0210e/x0210e/x0210e05.htm.—Trans.]
- 194 In 2004...plantations See Edward Smeets et al., Sustainability of Brazilian Bioethanol (Utrecht: University of Utrecht Copernicus Institute, Department of Science, Technology, and Society, August 2006), available at www.biofuels-platform.ch/en/media/download.php?get=195. The source of these statistics is Simon Schwartzman and Felipe Farah Schwartzman, "O trabalho infantil no Brasil," Jornal do Brazil (2004), available at www.schwartzman.org.br/simon/pdf/trab\_inf2004.pdf. See also The Good Practices of Labour Inspection in Brazil: The Eradication of Labour Analogous to Slavery (Geneva: International Labor Organization, 2010), www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed\_norm/---declaration/documents/publication/wcms\_155946.pdf.
- 194 Gilberto Freyre's famous book See note to p. 100.

## 25. CRIMINAL RECOLONIZATION

- 196 FoodFirst Information and Action Network "FIAN's vision is a world free from hunger, in which every woman, man and child can fully enjoy their human rights in dignity, particularly the right to adequate food, as laid down in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and other international human rights instruments" (www.fian.org/about-us/introduction).
- 196 Centre Europe—Tiers Monde For information on this organization, see www .cetim.ch/en/index.php?currentyear=&pid=. —Trans.
- 196 "First they took . . . Africa" Presumably Montwedi made his remarks in English; I have had to translate them from Jean Ziegler's French text here. —Trans.
- 196 Colombia provides . . . example I rely here upon reports from Human Rights Watch and Amnesty International. See especially an issue of Amnesty International Switzerland's magazine titled Agrocarburants: Réservoirs pleins et ventres vides, Magazine Amnesty 54 (September 2008), and in particular the article "Du sang sous les palmiers colombiens," www.amnesty.ch/fr/actuel/magazine/2008-3/monoculture-palme-africaine. [See also "Voix dissidentes sous pression," www.amnesty.ch/fr/actuel/magazine/2008-3

/journaliste-colombie-temoin-indesirable; "Réservoirs pleins et ventres vides," www.amnesty.ch/fr/actuel/magazine/2008-3/reservoirs-pleins-et -ventres-vides; "Les femmes laissées pour compte," www.amnesty.ch/fr/pays /ameriques/colombie/docs/2011/rapport-violence-sexuelle; "Des engagements sociaux multiples," www.amnesty.ch/fr/actuel/magazine/2008-3/colombie-salazar. Unfortunately, none of these articles appear to have been translated into English. —Trans.]

197 Between 2002 and 2007 . . . paramilitaries See "Bilan noir des droits humains en Colombie: Le président colombien Alvaro Uribe s'en prend à la Cour supreme," Le Temps, Geneva, September 20, 2008, www.letemps.ch /QueryResult?offset=120 (available in French to subscribers only).

197 In 1993...peace According to an exclusive report written for Sustainable Security, "The Colombian government has recently begun a process of returning land to the inhabitants of the river basins of Curvaradó and Jiguamiandó and reparation for victims of violence. The move is encouraging, but it might not be enough to solve the problems. The history of violence can repeat itself any moment, as long as the causes that led to the banishment and violence are not addressed and those responsible are not punished." See Amira Armenta, "Conflict, Poverty and Marginalisation: The Case of Curvaradó and Jiguamiandó (Urabá, Colombia)," Sustainable Security, July 2011, sustainablesecurity.org/article/conflict-poverty-and-marginalisation-case-curvarad%C3%B3-and-jiguamiand%C3%B3-urab%C3%A1-colombia. —Trans.

197 Human rights organizations . . . plantations According to Amnesty International; see note to p. 196.

197 the long battle... Ferrari See Sergio Ferrari, "Colombie: Une communauté paysanne tente de récupérer ses terres—Le label 'Bio suisse' impliqué dans une affaire d'expropriation?" Le Courrier, Geneva, March 15, 2011, available at www.kipa-apic.ch/index.php?pw=&na=0,0,0,0,f&ki=218084. [A good summary in English of the Las Pavas case, including recent developments, is Report, Independent Commission Land Conflict—Las Pavas—Boltvar, Colombia, Body Shop—Christian Aid, June 2010, www.thebodyshop.com/\_en/\_ww/services/pdfs/AboutUs/LasPavasReview.pdf. —Trans.]

198 Consider what is happening . . . Africa See Africa Up for Grabs: The Scale and Impact of Land Grabbing for Agrofuels, Friends of the Earth Europe and Friends of the Earth Africa, June 2010, www.foei.org/en/resources/publications/pdfs/2010/africa-up-for-grabs/view.

200 Jatropha curcas . . . oil Jatropha curcas is a flowering, poisonous, semievergreen shrub native to the American tropics and highly resistant to arid conditions, allowing it to be grown in desertlike climates; its seeds or nuts can be processed to yield a high-quality biodiesel fuel usable in standard diesel engines. —Trans.

200 In 2008 . . . contract The Financial Times published a series of detailed articles reporting on the secret agreement and its unraveling. See especially Tom Burgis, Song Jung-a, and Christian Oliver, "Daewoo to Cultivate Madagascar Land for Free," Financial Times, November 19, 2008, www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/6e894c6a-b65c-1ldd-89dd-0000779fdl8c.html. See also, by the same reporters, "Daewoo to Pay Nothing for Vast Land

Acquisition," Financial Times, November 20, 2008, www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/b0099666-b6a4-11dd-89dd-0000779fd18c.html; Javier Blas, "S[outh] Koreans to Lease Farmland in Madagascar," Financial Times, November 19, 2008, www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/ea8de830-b5d9-11dd-ab71-0000779fd18c.html; Javier Blas and Tom Burgis, "Madagascar Scraps Daewoo Farm Deal," Financial Times, March 18, 2009, www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/7e133310-13ba-11de-9e32-0000779fd2ac.html; and Javier Blas, "UN Moves to Curb Farmland Grabs," Financial Times, March 25, 2012, www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/083aab3a-7697-11e1-8e1b-00144feab49a.html.—Trans.

201 Sierra Leone . . . world See United Nations Development Program, Human Development Report 2010, 20th Anniversary Edition—The Real Wealth of Nations: Pathways to Human Development (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), available at hdr.undp.org/en/media/HDR\_2010\_EN\_Complete\_reprint.pdf.

201 Spread out among...highlands Joan Baxter, "Le cas Addax Bioenergy," Le Monde Diplomatique, January 2010, www.monde-diplomatique.fr/2010/01 /BAXTER/18712.

203 an independent field study . . . false Coastal and Environmental Services, Environmental Social and Health Impact Assessment (ESHIA), undertaken on behalf of Addax Bioenergy by Coastal and Environmental Services for the Makeni Sugarcane to Ethanol Biofuel Project in Sierra Leone (October 2009). [This report is supposed to be available at the Coastal and Environmental Services Public Documents webpage, though as of May 2012 it was not: www.cesnet.co.za/publicdocs.html. The report was rated as exemplary in an independent study commissioned by the European Commission to assess the value of biofuel environmental impact assessments (EIAs) in determining a project's sustainability and compliance with the European Union Renewable Energy Directive (EU RED). See Oskar Englund et al., Environmental Impact Assessments: Suitable for Supporting Assessments of Biofuel Sustainability?—Analysis of EIAs from the Perspective of EU Sustainability Requirements for Biofuels (Technical Report for the EU Biofuel Baseline Project) (Gothenburg: Department of Energy and Environment, Division of Physical Resource Theory, Chalmers University of Sociology, 2011), publications.lib.chalmers.se/records/fulltext/local\_146738.pdf. For Addax's perspective, see also Q&A: Addax Bioenergy Sugarcane Ethanol Project in Makeni, Sierra Leone, www.addax-oryx.com/AddaxBioenergy/Addax -Bioenergy-FAO.pdf. —Trans.]

204 The Canadian Renewable Fuels Association . . . "absurd" Lauren Etter, "UN Is Urged to Disavow 'Rogue' Biofuels Remarks," Wall Street Journal, November 13, 2007, A6. [This article is not available online. —Trans.]

# 26. THE "TIGER SHARKS"

207 With its powerful jaws Jean Ziegler could have added here two more facts about tiger sharks that speak very much to his metaphor. After the great white shark, the tiger is responsible for more confirmed attacks on humans than any other species. The tiger also seems to be one of the most voracious of all shark species, often swallowing its prey whole; sometimes nicknamed the "ocean's garbage can," tigers have been found with all manner

- of inorganic objects in their gut, including license plates, oil cans, tires, fishing gear, boat furniture, and baseballs. Unlike commodities market speculators, however, the tiger shark is an endangered species. —Trans.
- 208 Société Générale Société Générale S.A. is one of the oldest banks in France and a globally active financial services company. It is the second-largest French bank behind BNP Paribas and the eighth largest bank in the European zone.—Trans.
- 208 Jérôme Kerviel . . . bank In October 2010, the Eleventh Chambre Correctionnelle (Criminal Court) of Paris sentenced Jérôme Kerviel to five years in prison (with the possibility of release after three years) and a fine for damages and interest of 4.9 billion euros. [Kerviel's appeal of his conviction is currently pending. —Trans.]
- 208 By contrast . . . 51.85 percent GAIA Capital Advisors, GAIA World Agri Food Fund February 2011 report, www.gaiacap.ch/newsletters/gwa\_nav \_feb\_11.pdf company. (In Greek mythology, Gaia was the Earth personified as a goddess.)
- 208 the purchase (or sale)...markets Nicholas Kaldor, "Speculation and Economic Stability," Review of Economic Studies 7, no. 1 (October, 1939): 1–27, at 1.
- 208 "Speculation is... reward" Miguel Robles, Maxime Torero, and Joachim von Braun, When Speculation Matters, IFPRI Issue Brief 57 (Washington, DC: International Food Policy Research Institute, 2009), 2, available at www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=l&ved=0CCIQFjAA&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.abhatoo.net.ma%2Findex.php%2Ffre%2Fcontent%2Fdownload%2F13502%2F230576%2Ffile%2FWhen\_Speculation\_matters.pdf&ei=9TijT8w7ht3RAfjogSc&usg=AFQjCNGqVv95fz4h\_oILBRzom\_-q96hN-Q&sig2=8YnvbjPdPulN\_r6beJpVkg.
- 209 the first derivatives . . . 43 percent Olivier Pastré, "La crise alimentaire mondiale n'est pas une fatalité," in Les nouveaux équilibres agroalimentaires mondiaux, ed. Pierre Jacquet and Jean-Hervé Lorenzi (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France-PUF, in the series Les Cahiers du Cercle des Économistes, 2011), 29.
- 209 this market is . . . amplifies Ibid.
- 211 Many factors are . . . speculation See Jacquet and Lorenzi, Les nouveaux équilibres agroalimentaires mondiaux (see note to p. 209).
- 211 The crisis of 2008 . . . 2006 This idea is defended particularly by Philippe Chalmin, in Le monde a faim: Quelques réflexions sur l'avenir agricole et alimentaire de l'humanité au XXIe siècle (Paris: Bourin Éditeur, 2009). El Niño is a seasonal warm current in the Pacific originating off the coast of Peru near the equator, which has in the last several years caused numerous extreme weather events.
- 211 In 2008...2006 See the FAO's The State of Agricultural Commodity Markets 2009: High Food Prices and the Food Crisis—Experiences and Lessons Learned (Rome, 2009), www.fao.org/docrep/012/i0854e/i0854e00.htm.
- 212 in March [2008] . . . ton See Chalmin, Le monde a faim (see note to p. 211).
- 212 As for corn . . . market Ibid.
- 213 "That speculation on . . . financiers" Ibid., 45.
- 213 The hedge funds... 2007 Laetitia Clavreul, "La spéculation sur les matières premières affole le monde agricole," Le Monde, April 24, 2008, available to subscribers or for purchase at www.lemonde.fr/cgi-bin/ACHATS

- /acheter.cgi?offre=ARCHIVES&type\_item=ART\_ARCH\_30J&objet id=1033563&xtmc=laetitia\_clavreul&xtcr=4.
- 213 The Senate denounced . . . applied" See U.S. Senate Committee on Homeland Security and Governmental Affairs, "Investigations Subcommittee Releases Levin-Coburn Report on Excessive Speculation in the Wheat Market: Report Calls for Clampdown on Index Traders Buying Wheat Futures," June 23, 2009, www.hsgac.senate.gov/media/majority-media/investigations -subcommittee-releases-levin-coburn-report-on-excessive-speculation-in -the-wheat-market. The Levin-Coburn Report itself, released by the Senate Permanent Committee on Investigations in advance of hearings in July 2009. is not currently available online, but its conclusions are summarized in this press release. Video recordings and the print transcripts of the hearings are available at www.hsgac.senate.gov/subcommittees/investigations/hearings /excessive-speculation-in-the-wheat-market, Jean Ziegler refers to Paul-Florent Montfort, "Le Sénat américain dénonce la spéculation excessive sur les marches à terme agricoles: Rapport du sous-comité permanent du Sénat des États-Unis en charge des enquêtes," Mouvement pour une Organization Mondiale de l'Agriculture (2009), www.momagri.org/FR/articles/Le-Senat -americain-denonce-la-speculation-excessive-sur-les-marches-a-terme -agricoles 538.html. This article provides more details from the report than the Senate's press release does, albeit in French. —Trans.
- 214 "Many producer countries . . . so on)" See Clavreul, "La speculation" (see note to p. 213).
- 215 West African CFA francs The CFA franc is the common currency of the eight members of the UEMOA (Union Économique et Monétaire Ouest Africaine, the West African Economic and Monetary Union): Benin, Burkina Faso, Ivory Coast, Guinea-Bissau, Mali, Niger, Senegal, and Togo. CFA stands for Communauté Financière d'Afrique (Financial Community of Africa). The currency is issued by the BCEAO (Banque Centrale des États de l'Afrique de l'Ouest, the Central Bank of the West African States), located in Dakar. —Trans.
- 216 FOB (free on board) FOB is a system that specifies whether the buyer or the seller pays for shipment and loading costs, and/or where responsibility for goods is transferred from buyer to seller, and therefore also which party is liable for goods lost or damaged in transit.—Trans.
- 216 spot market A spot market, also called a cash market, is a public financial market on which commodities or financial markets are traded for immediate delivery. By contrast, a futures market handles trades whose delivery is due at a later date. The spot market today functions largely over the Internet. —Trans.
- 216 This is how...economy See "L'inquiétante volatilité des prix des matières premières agricoles," Le Monde, January 11, 2011, www.lemonde.fr /planete/article/2011/01/11/1-inquietante-volatilite-des-prix-des-matieres-premieres-agricoles\_1463798\_3244.html. See also the World Bank, Poverty Reduction and Equity Group, "Food Price Watch," February 2011, siteresources.worldbank.org/INTPOVERTY/Resources/335642-1210859591030/Food\_Price\_Watch\_Feb2011.pdf.
- 216 The World Bank's . . . (12%) World Bank, "Food Price Watch," 1 (see the preceding note).

- 216 Higher global wheat . . . (16%) Ibid., 2.
- 217 Maize prices have . . . prices Ibid., 2.
- 217 Domestic rice prices . . . poor Ibid., 4. See also Jean-Christophe Kroll and Aurélie Trouvé, "G20 et sécurité alimentaire: la vanité des discours," Le Monde, February 28, 2011, www.lemonde.fr/idees/article/2011/02/28/g20-et-securite-alimentaire-la-vanite-des-discours\_1486039\_3232.html.
- 218 There would not... products Isabelle Hachey, "La spéculation au coeur de la crise alimentaire," interview with Olivier De Schutter, LaPresse.ca, October 16, 2010.
- 218 The impact of . . . control UN Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD), Trade and Development Report 2008: Commodity Prices, Capital Flows and the Financing of Investment (Geneva, 2008), II.
- 219 Our members represent . . . US\$5 billion World Economic Forum, Frequently Asked Questions, www.weforum.org/faq.
- 219 "What kind of civilization . . . eat?" See Chalmin, Le monde a faim, 52 (see note to p. 211).
- 220 "We have to snatch . . . speculators" Heiner Flassbeck, "Rohstoffe den Spekulanten entreissen," Handelsblatt, Düsseldorf, February 11, 2011. [My translation from the original German here is via Jean Ziegler's French, since the Handelsblatt has no online presence. —Trans.]
- 220 The proposal by Fassbeck . . . 2009 See Robles, Torero, and Braun, When Speculation Matters (see note to p. 208).
- 220 But what is lacking...it In the United States there is an agency appointed to regulate speculation in food commodities, the U.S. Commodity Futures Trading Commission; the commission has proven to be exceptionally ineffectual.

## 27. GENEVA, WORLD CAPITAL OF AGRI-FOOD SPECULATORS

- 221 "is equally inseparable...lobby" Marc Roche, "Haro sur les spéculateurs fous!"

  Le Monde, January 30, 2011, available to subscribers or for purchase at www
  .lemonde.fr/cgi-bin/ACHATS/acheter.cgi?offre=ARCHIVES&type
  \_item=ART\_ARCH\_30J&objet\_id=1147156&xtmc=speculateurs&x
  tcr=1.
- 222 In this sector... London In 2009, Prime Minister Gordon Brown took severe measures to limit the bonuses, stock options, raises, and other premiums added to the exorbitant incomes of hedge fund managers: anyone paid more than 200,000 pounds (about \$325,000) annually is taxed at the rate of 50 percent on the excess.
- 222 Jabre Capital Partners See Marc Roche's profile of Jabre, "Le retour en force de Philippe Jabre, roi des hedge funds," Le Monde, April 26, 2011, available to subscribers or for purchase at www.lemonde.fr/cgi-bin/ACHATS /acheter.cgi?offre=ARCHIVES&type\_item=ART\_ARCH\_30J&objet\_id=1155273&xtmc=philippe\_jabre&xtcr=1.
- 222 The volume of business . . . 2010 See "Genève, paradis du négoce," La Liberté, Fribourg, March 25, 2011, available to subscribers or for purchase at www .laliberte.ch/economie/geneve-paradis-du-negoce.
- 222 In addition... law See the investigative report by Elisabeth Eckert, "1500 milliards de francs, au moins, échappent à tout contrôle en Suisse," Le

- Matin Dimanche, April 2, 2011,,,m,,,, new.lematin.ch/actu/economie/1500-milliards-de-francs-au-moins-%C3%A9chappent-%C3%A0-tout-contr%C3%B4le-en-suisse.
- 224 "We don't regulate . . . so" See Eckert, "1500 milliards de francs" (see the preceding note). [See also Pierre-François Besson, "Financial Regulator Says Crisis Not Over," interview with Anne Héritier Lachat, trans. Clare O'Dea, Swissinfo.ch, March 23, 2011, www.swissinfo.ch/eng/business/Financial\_regulator\_says\_crisis\_not\_over.html?cid=29810118). —Trans.]
- 224 "How can it be . . . oversight?" See Eckert, "1500 milliards de francs" (see note to p. 222).
- 224 (JetFin is a . . . industry) For JetFin's own version of its activities, see www .jetfin.com/english. —Trans.
- 224 "Agriculture today is . . . markets" The quote here is my translation from a JetFin brochure text quoted by Jean Ziegler, which is not available online. See also "Why Attend?" at www.jetfin.com/agro2011-geneva/eventinfo\_en.php: "This event brings together investors and fund managers to examine investment strategies and risks in the areas of soft commodities, farming, carbon, timber, water. JetFin AGRO 2011 conference is a unique event, gathering top fund managers deploying winning investment strategies in agriculture. Leading fund managers present and explain their investment strategies. International investors searching hard assets and real alpha in natural resources and agriculture can meet face to face with some of the best fund managers in the field. Fund of funds managers and investors share their views on current strategic and tactical allocations in soft commodities and agriculture."—Trans.
- Two powerful NGOs...government For more information about Fastenopfer, see www.fastenopfer.org/sites/home/index.html?lang2=en; for Bread for All, see www.ppp.ch/en/english. The June 28, 2010, letter appears not to be available online. However, a letter addressed to the Geneva government on May 25, 2011, protesting the following JetFin conference in 2011, presumably in similar terms, and signed by twenty-two NGOs led by Fastenopfer and Bread for All, is available at www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=1&ved=0CGMQFjAA&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.agrisodu.ch%2Findex.php%3Foption%3Dcom\_docman%26task%3Ddoc\_download%26gid%3D299%26Itemid%3D&ei=QDCsT6C-EIPC0QH8s\_j6Dw&usg=AFQjCNEQQ-QgO1FbEkQ6Ycs5hGJoK9ZntA&sig2=emSf40cZY5XzmldMKjnduw.—Trans.

## 28. LAND GRABS AND THE RESISTANCE OF THE DAMNED

- 226 But even before . . . (988,000 acres) Marc Guéniat, "Le jeune Sud-Soudan brade déjà ses terres agricoles—Une société texane a obtenu le contrat du siècle: 600,000 hectares pour 25,000 dollars, avec agriculture et pétrole à la clé," La Tribune de Genève, June 9, 2011, archives.tdg.ch/jeune-sud-soudan-brade-terres-agricoles-2011-06-09.
- 226 In Switzerland . . . clientele Yvan Maillard Ardenti, "Accaparement des terres et flux financiers internationaux: L'Implication du secteur financier Suisse," in L'accaparement des terres: La course aux terres aggrave la faim dans le

NOTES

monde, ed. Pascale Schnyder and Ester Wolf (Lausanne: Pain pour le Prochain and Action de Carême [Bread for All and Fastenopfer], in the series Collection Repères, January 2010), 16–17, www.ppp.ch/fileadmin/francais/Politique\_developpement/Reperes%20et%20publications/Reperes-1-2010\_01.pdf; also available in German. [This report is not available in English, but see Anh-Nga Tran Nguyen, "Global Land Grabbing: Issues and Solutions," Bread for All, September 2010, www.brotfueralle.ch/fileadmin/deutsch/2\_Entwicklungpolitik\_allgemein/A\_Recht\_auf\_Nahrung/Global%20land%20grabbing%20by%20ATN.pdf.—Trans.]

- 227 The Sarasin and Pictet . . . Russia Ibid., 17.
- 227 In the context... consequences Miges Baumann, "La soif de terres aggrave la faim dans le monde" in Schnyder and Wolf, L'accaparement des terres, 7 (see note to p. 226).
- 228 We might consider . . . effort Alexandre Vilgrain, "Jouons Collectifs!" editorial, La Lettre du CIAN, November—December 2010, 1, www.cian.asso.fr/cianweb/cianweb-img.nsf/FindIMG/3.-La%20Lettre%20du%20CIAN%20Nov-Dec%202010.pdf/\$FILE/La%20Lettre%20du%20CIAN%20Nov-Dec%202010.pdf.
- 229 World Social Forum For more on the World Social Forum 2011, see fsm2011 .org. —Trans.
- 229 Cameroon, which is . . . continent See Transparency International's annually updated Corruption Perceptions Index; the 2011 index is available at cpi .transparency.org/cpi2011/results.
- 229 This time, SOSUCAM... annually See "Cameroun: Somdiaa sucre les droits," Appels Urgents 341, Peuples Solidaires/ActionAid, February 12, 2010, www.peuples-solidaires.org/341-cameroun-somdiaa-sucre-les-droits. [Basic information about Peuples Solidaires is available in English at www.peuples-solidaires.org/welcome. —Trans.]
- 230 According to the resistors . . . processing Ibid.
- 230 "human values are... Group" As recently as mid-2012, SOMDIAA included this statement on an "About Us" page at its website: www.somdiaa.com /en/groupe/nous-connaitre. The slogan was widely quoted and excoriated in the online pro—farmers' rights press. SOMDIAA now has a much more elaborate statement of its values at www.somdiaa.com/groupe/les-valeurs (in French only), which opens with the claim that as a "family-owned company, SOMDIAA has always supported business practices based on respect for fundamental human values, which are shared with all of our partners," and continues at length in a similar vein. —Trans.
- 231 The majority of . . . less Ester Wolf, "Spéculation foncière au Bénin au détriment des plus pauvres," in Schnyder and Wolf, L'accaparement des terres, 20–22 (see note to p. 226).
- 231 "the current prices . . . forever" Ibid., 21.
- 232 Euro RSCG In the fall of 2012, Euro RSCG Worldwide was renamed Havas Worldwide. —Trans.
- 232 However, Yayi was...voters) Philippe Perdrix, "Bénin: Boni Yayi, vainqueur par K.O., investi pour un second quinquennat," Jeune Afrique, April 8, 2011, www.jeuneafrique.com/Article/ARTJAJA2620p024-026.xml0. [The op-

position candidates in Benin alleged massive electoral fraud, but the election results were upheld by the country's constitutional court. See Dwyer Ace, "Benin Court Confirms Presidential Election Results Amid Fraud Allegations," Jurist Paper Chase Newsburst, March 21, 2011, jurist.org/paperchase/2011/03/benin-court-confirms-presidential-election-results-amid-fraud-allegations.php.—Trans.]

- 232 "While local small farmers... fallow" Quoted in Wolf, "Spéculation foncière," 20 (see notes to pp. 226 and 231).
- 232 ROPPA For more on ROPPA, see p. 49.
- 232 In 2008...government See Philippe Bernard, "La crise en Libye remet en cause la cession d'une vaste zone rizicole au Mali," Le Monde, April 1, 2011, available to subscribers or for purchase at www.lemonde.fr/cgi-bin /ACHATS/acheter.cgi?offre=ARCHIVES&type\_item=ART\_ARCH \_30J&objet\_id=1153008&xtmc=malibya&xtcr=1.
- 233 "The Libyans behave . . . here" Ibid.
- 233 "run on agricultural . . . imprisoned" Ibid.
- 233 "the necessity of . . . area" Ibid.

#### 29. THE COMPLICITY OF THE WESTERN STATES

239 Considering that recent . . . land World Social Forum 2011, Dakar Appeal Against the Land Grab; the text of the appeal is available at many websites, including www.petitiononline.com/dakar/petition.html.

#### **EPILOGUE**

- 242 But where there . . . grows Hölderlin's lines, which come from one of his most famous poems, read in German: "Wo aber Gefahr ist, wächst / Das Rettende auch." The translation in the epigraph is my own. —Trans.
- 244 "Earth provides enough . . . greed" This proverb has entered the realm of Gandhi folklore and is attributed to the Mahatma in many different and slightly erroneous versions. The original source is a firsthand witness, Pyarelal, in a chapter titled "Towards New Horizons" in part two of his Mahatma Gandhi: The Last Phase (1958 and later editions); for an authoritative account, with interesting observations on Gandhi's evolving and prescient views on food, hunger, and ecology, see Y.P. Anand and Mark Lindley, "Gandhi on Providence and Greed," available at independent.academia .edu/MarkLindley/Papers/255823/Gandhi\_on\_providence\_and\_greed. The full context of Pyarelal's account of Gandhi's remark speaks even more potently to Jean Ziegler's work:

In addition to the economic and the biological, there is another aspect of man's being that enters into [human] relationships with nature, namely the spiritual. When the balance between the spiritual and the material is disturbed, sickness results.

"Earth [pritvi, the world] provides enough to satisfy every man's need but not for every man's greed," said Gandhiji. So long as we cooperate with the cycle of life, the soil renews its fertility indefinitely and provides health, recreation, sustenance and peace to those who

- depend on it. But when the "predatory" attitude prevails, nature's balance is upset and there is an all-round biological deterioration.

  —Trans.
- 244 Eric Toussaint . . . Germany Eric Toussaint, Damien Millet, and Daniel Munevar, "Les chiffres de la dette 2011," CADTM (Comité pour l'Abolition de la Dette du Tiers-monde), Liège, April 19, 2011, www.cadtm.org/IMG /pdf/Les\_chiffres\_de\_la\_dette\_2011\_DEf.pdf; also available in Spanish and Portuguese (but not in English) at www.cadtm.org/Les-chiffres-de-la-dette-2011. See also, by the same authors, with others, La Dette ou la Vie (Brussels and Liège: ADEN and CADTM, 2011); and Capgemini and Merrill Lynch Global Wealth Management, World Wealth Report 2011, www.us.capgemini.com/services-and-solutions/by-industry/financial-services\*/solutions/wealth/worldwealthreport.
- 245 "In the field . . . important" Amartya Sen, "Food, Economics and Entitlements," WIDER Working Paper 1, United Nations University World Institute for Development Economics Research, February 1986, 4, www .wider.unu.edu/publications/working-papers/previous/en\_GB/wp-01/files/82530785773748791/default/WP1.pdf.
- 246 First, by combating...bring See the classic treatment of this subject by Georg Cremer, Corruption and Development Aid: Confronting the Challenges (London: Lynne Rienner, 2008).
- 247 "Pessimism of the . . . will" Antonio Gramsci, in a letter from prison to his brother Carlo, dated December 19, 1929, in Gramsci, Selections from the Prison Notebooks, ed. Quintin Hoare and Geoffrey Nowell Smith (London: Electric Book Company, 2001; New York: International Publishers, 1971), 395. While Gramsci made this maxim, and many variants of it, famous, Hoare and Smith, among others, attribute it originally to Romain Rolland.

  —Trans.
- 248 Almost half of . . . life La Via Campesina, "Declaration of Rights of Peasants—Women and Men," March 2009, viacampesina.net/down loads/PDF/EN-3.pdf. [A better translation of campesinos/campesinas (or the French paysans/paysannes) than "peasants—women and men" would be "small farmers"—which is the term I have adopted throughout this book.

  —Trans.]
- 248 Sólo le pido . . . enough "Sólo le pido a Dios," words and music by Léon Gieco (1978); translation mine. —Trans.